

Emerging Services for Community-Based Long-Term Care in Urban China: A Systematic Analysis of Shanghai's Community-Based Agencies

By: [Bei Wu, PhD](#); Mary W. Carter, PhD; R. Turner Goins, PhD; Chunrong Cheng, BS

Wu, B., Carter, M.W., Goins, T.R., & Cheng, C.R. (2005). Emerging Services for Community-Based Long-Term Care (CBLTC) in Urban China: A Systematic Analysis of Shanghai's Community-based Agencies. *Journal of Aging and Social Policy*, 17(4), 37-60.

Made available courtesy of Haworth Press and Taylor & Francis: <http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/haworth-journals.asp>

***** Note: Figures may be missing from this format of the document**

Abstract:

China's rapid economic reforms, coupled with the changes in age composition of the demographic structure, have greatly affected the traditional family support system. In response to these changes, efforts to develop new models of community-based long-term care (CBLTC) for elders in China have received growing attention. This paper provides a systematic analysis of the current status of emerging CBLTC systems in Shanghai, China. It covers several domains of the system: service delivery, workforce, financing, and quality of care management. Several main issues involved in the development of the emerging system are addressed, and relevant policy implications are presented in the paper.

KEYWORDS. Elder care, community-based long-term care, China, elders, policy

Article:

INTRODUCTION

Chinese elders traditionally have relied on family members for nearly all aspects of elder care and support, reflecting the oft-recognized traditional values of filial piety and the economic realities of the limited availability of resources from outside the home. More importantly, the Chinese government has emphasized maintaining the tradition of family support for elders through a series of laws that requires families to assume responsibility in caring for older adult parents both economically and otherwise. By and large, the implementation of the laws reflects the underlying value of filial piety. In addition, these policies also reflect, in part, China's attempts to limit the current and anticipated share of the state's costs for elders as well as to ensure the continued economic stability and development of the state by targeting only selected subgroups of the older population, namely, elders without adult children, for participation in state-sponsored social welfare programs providing long-term care services.

Although the Chinese government encourages older adults to be resourceful during their old age (Ikels, 1990), the role of the family as bearing primary responsibility in providing for their aged parents is clearly articulated in the Chinese Constitution. It states, "Children who have come of age have the duty to support and assist their parents" (Yang, 1988). Failure to meet obligations of respecting elders is punishable under China's Criminal Code (Beijing Review, 1987). The establishment of the Elders' Protection Law of The People's Republic of China in 1996 further emphasizes the legal responsibility of children to support their parents in old age (Elders' Protection Law of People's Republic of China, 1996). Additionally, common living arrangements among elders in China reflect government policies that encourage care of elders by assigning larger government housing for multigenerational households. The vast majority of elders in Shanghai live at home, while less than 1 % of elders live in long-term care institutions (Xin Hua News Agency, 2003).

In addition to informal support provided by family members, two sources of formal assistance have been available to elders: *Danwei* (work units) and *bao hu zhu* (no corresponding translation). *Danwei* is considered a labor-based enterprise. In urban China, *danwei* traditionally played an important role in assisting families by supplementing in-formal care with various formal care services (Olson, 1987). In large cities like Shanghai and

Beijing, more than 70% of trade unions operating in state-run factories organized special committees to assist their retirees with various day-to-day needs. For example, these committees distribute relief funds to elders and their families, visit retirees on holidays, arrange for someone to help families provide hands-on care for their older family member, and provide assistance to families following the death of the older family member by assisting with funeral arrangements (Olson, 1987). However, with the diminishing importance of the work unit for the urban worker following recent economic reform policies, the services provided by these committees have begun to diminish.

Bao hu zhu represents a second type of formal community-based in-home care commonly used in urban areas of China during the early 1980s through late 1990s. (In Shanghai, there are four hierarchical levels of government organizations: municipality committees, district committees, street station committees, and neighborhood committees. Currently, Shanghai has one municipality committee, 18 districts committees, 99 street station committees, and 3,393 neighborhood committees.) Under this system, local street station committees, *Jie Dao* identified childless elders and other elders needing in-home care services and then organized and assigned a caregiver (*bao hu zhu*) for these elders. The street station committees trained and supervised the caregiver and would make regular visits to the elder's home. During visits, the *bao hu zhu* would assist with preparing meals, running errands, and accompanying elders to health care visits. The types and arrangements of services provided by *bao hu zhu* varied from short-term in-home care via volunteers to formal agreements to exchange services between household units, in which a healthy elder would agree to provide household services to a younger working family, such as cooking meals, in return for care to the elder should she or he become ill in the future (Liang & Gu, 1989; Olson, 1993). In 1988, there were 54,000 individuals caring for 88,000 older adults in China under this arrangement (Olson, 1994).

However, during the mid-1980s and particularly in the 1990s, China's economic structure underwent extensive changes, shifting from a centralized, planned economy to a more market-based economy. The rapid economic reforms, coupled with the changes in age composition of the demographic structure, have greatly affected the traditional family support system and the supplemental support system from *danwei* and *baohu zhu*. In response to these changes, efforts to develop new models of community-based long-term care (CBLTC) in China have received growing attention. In this study, CBLTC refers to a set of care services, such as personal care, homemakers, and adult day care, which are delivered to frail elders in their communities. Using Shanghai as a study site, the aims of this paper are to provide a description of these efforts in urban China, review the circumstances from which the current system emerged, and provide future consideration on the policy implications associated with the current approach to building a CBLTC infrastructure in urban China.

BACKGROUND

Impact of China's Economic Reform

Rapid economic developments during the past decade have resulted in a shift from community-based care through *danwei* to care delivered from various community entities. Previously, large government-run enterprises assumed many responsibilities for retired workers, including retirement wages or pensions, health care expenditures, and in-home long-term care assistance for frail elders. As China's economy has shifted to a market-based, competitive system, the cost of supporting elders during their retirement has been felt more directly by these enterprises as they became more sensitive to bottom-line profitability. Consequently, those enterprises choosing to continue the traditional old-age pension system have encountered economic disadvantage compared with recently established private and collectively owned companies that do not assume responsibilities for their retired workers. Following the economic changes, many enterprises either went bankrupt and/or merged into different companies, further reducing the number of businesses willing or able to continue the traditional services for retirees through work assignments. Many older retirees, especially poorer ones, no longer have the security of these collective provisions from their former *danwei*.

Besides the direct effect that China's economic reforms have had on government-operated businesses, the economic reforms have also led to dramatic increases in the number of laid-off workers in the cities. Many enterprises, especially state-run enterprises, have entered bankruptcy following the economy's transition to a

more market-based, competitive system. In 2002, there were 4.1 million laid-off workers from state-run enterprises in China (National Bureau of Statistics of China, 2003). In Shanghai, the total number of laid-off workers was more than one million during the period between 1991 and 2000 (Zhao, 2003). More significantly, this problem is compounded by the tremendous in-flux of migrant workers from rural areas to major cities in search of employment. In the past, China's housing registration system had strictly limited farmers moving to the cities, which discouraged mass migration. However, today, the potential job opportunities, higher incomes, and living standards have attracted many migrant workers to leave their homes for the cities. Because the urban housing registration system has become more relaxed in recent years by allowing migrant workers to apply for temporary registration in the cities, cities are experiencing rapid in-migration. According to the Fifth Chinese Census, there were 3.87 million migrant populations in Shanghai alone, and 73.4% (2.84 million) of them had entered the labor force. Countrywide, there were over 121 million migrants across China (National Bureau of Statistics of China, 2002a).

Among those migrant populations in the labor force in Shanghai, almost half (1.35 million) are women aged 49 years and younger (Shanghai Statistical Bureau, 2001). Many of these women find employment as *bao mu* (literally, housemaid), which now represents one of the main areas of work available to female migrant workers entering Shanghai from rural areas. *Bao mu* provide various in-home services for elders and their families, sometimes caring simultaneously for younger children and older grandparents. Reported estimates suggest that approximately 200,000 (Shanghai Fifth Census Office, 2001) to 300,000 (XinMin Weekly, 2002) migrant workers are working in Shanghai as *bao mu*. Given that many migrant workers are not registered, the actual number of migrant workers and those who are working as *bao mu* are probably larger than the Fifth Census estimates. Additionally, many female migrant workers work as *hu gong* (nurse aides) at residential care facilities for elders, which may be privately operated or government-sponsored. Although the role of *bao hu zhu* has diminished following the rapid economic reforms in urban China, the ensuing economic development has dramatically increased the number of *bao mu* in the market, at a time when many people in the cities find hiring *bao mu* more affordable. Therefore, young people are now more likely to hire *bao mu* to provide services, instead of asking elders to provide household services in return for elder care in the future.

From a more social perspective, the economic developments have affected individual filial piety values, economic status, living conditions, and living arrangements of elders and their families. Although most adult children still consider it their responsibility to provide care for older parents, more are struggling to fulfill their multiple responsibilities (Chappell, 2003). Firstly, while more young people and their families are able to afford to hire *bao mu* to provide services, there also has been an increase in the number of needy elderly who cannot afford such services, reflecting in part the growing polarization of income levels. Findings from a national survey conducted in 1998 revealed that in urban China, the income among the highest earners (20th percentile) was 9.6 times higher than those in the lowest income (bottom fifth) (Li, 2001). Secondly, working adult children may find additional pressure due to the recent improvements in housing conditions that have increased the likelihood that adult children have their own apartments and live separately from their parents. This greater independence between adult children and elders raises concerns about care when elders become frail. In addition, the problem created by separate living arrangements is further exacerbated by the growing mobility of younger adults in China, in that the economic developments have created opportunities for young adults, but those opportunities may not be located where their parents live. One study conducted among community-dwelling elders in Shanghai revealed that among the oldest old, defined as individuals aged 80 years or older, 19% lived only with a spouse, while another 5% lived alone (Wu et al., 2002). Mostly likely, if the current trends and economic developments continue, adult children will increasingly live independently from their parents.

Impact of Demographic Changes

The economic changes outlined will undoubtedly affect and be affected by the aging of China's population. China has experienced significant changes in the size and proportion of older adults over the past two decades, and this trend will continue for the next 50 years (Zeng, Vaupel, Xiao, & Liu, 2002). China's elderly population, defined as adults aged 60 years and older, reached 130 million in 2000, and comprised more than 10% of the total population. The oldest-old, aged 80 years and older, grew to approximately 11.5 million individuals in the

year 2000 and accounted for nearly 9% of all elders aged 60 years and older (National Bureau of Statistics of China, 2002b). By the year 2020, China's population aged 60 years and older is estimated to reach 243 million people, representing 17% of the total population (National Population and Family Planning Commission of China, 2003). Besides growing in absolute numbers, the aged population in China is expected to undergo significant aging itself. It is estimated that the number of the oldest-old will reach 27.80 million in 2020 (Yue, 2001).

The rapid growth of China's aging population in absolute terms and as a percentage of population is largely due to the implementation of the one-child policy over the last two decades, coupled with a sizable increase in the average life expectancy (Harbaugh & West, 1993; Yuan, Zhang, Ping, Li, & Liang, 1992). Due to smaller families with fewer children, the availability of family members to provide care and support to their older parents will most likely continue to decrease (Bartlett & Phillips, 1997). Facing the increasing challenge of caring for current and future elders, the demand for community-based services and programs for elders has become a critical issue in China. Both formal and informal forms of CBLTC have begun to emerge in China, especially in more densely populated, urban centers.

METHODS

This study uses Shanghai as a study site to analyze systematically emerging services for long-term care that are provided by community-based agencies. In 2003, Shanghai has a total population of 13.4 million, of which 2.55 million are aged 60 years and older. The proportion aged varies among the 18 districts in the Shanghai municipality, ranging from 16% to 22% (Shanghai Research Center on Aging, 2004). Since organization of Shanghai's CBLTC system is a complex arrangement among various government and non-government agencies and related funding sources, several approaches to data collection were used.

First, an examination of available policy documents and literature review were conducted. Information gathered helped to direct the next four steps, including the development of the interview formats and construction of the survey instruments.

The second step involved interviews with policymakers and government officials. The principal investigator (BW) traveled to China during December 2002 and met with several officials from the Shanghai Civil Affairs Bureau, the main government agency responsible for the planning, provision, and oversight of CBLTC and related facilities operating in Shanghai.

Third, the principal investigator organized a graduate-level seminar entitled *Community-Based Long-Term Care*, which was designed for long-term care professionals who were primarily employed by the Shanghai Civil Affairs Bureau. Many of the seminar participants were employed as administrators from the local civil affairs offices, Shanghai's Committees on Aging, heads of residential care facilities, or administrators from mental health hospitals. Discussions with seminar participants provided focus-group style interaction between the principal investigator and representatives from various offices involved in Shanghai's emerging CBLTC system.

The fourth step involved field visits to eight representative community-based agencies for CBLTC, including nursing homes that provided CBLTC services in addition to their residential-based services. The following sites were visited: (a) Jingansi Community Services Center for Elders at Jing An District, (b) Peng Pu Street Community Services Center at Zha Bei District, (c) Hong Qiao Street Community Services Center, (d) Chang Ning Street at Chang Ning District, (e) Si Chuan North Street at Hong Kou District, (f) Golden Gulf Nursing Home and Community Service Center at Lu Wan District, (g) Shanghai No. 1 Residential Home for Elders, and (h) Shanghai No. 3 Residential Home for Elders, with sites "g" and "h" representing nursing homes.

The fifth step involved survey data collection. A total of 71 self-administered surveys were completed by administrators and staff employed from 54 facilities, 39 of which were community-based agencies and 15 of which were residential care facilities. The survey was distributed using convenience sampling identified through a personal network, mainly through students who took the seminar. Among those interviewed, 44% were executive directors, 28% were directors of a single division located within a larger agency, and 27% worked in administration.

FINDINGS

The main government agency in Shanghai that supports CBLTC services is the Shanghai Municipal Civil Affairs Bureau. Although the bureau operates at the municipal level, it houses smaller divisions that operate within each of 18 districts. Together, these agencies perform funding and supervisory functions, as well as directly providing some CBLTC services. In addition, the Shanghai Municipal Civil Affairs Bureau conducts and disseminates policy-relevant research on issues related to aging and CBLTC. Under the auspices of this office, local government level, street station committees, and neighborhood committees provide additional resources at the local level. Table 1 provides an overview of the organizational structure of CBLTC services in Shanghai, including descriptions of the sponsoring agency, level of administration, types of services provided, funding mechanisms, and the primary source of frontline workers.

Community-Based Agencies

CBLTC services are provided predominantly through two types of community-based agencies: (1) Community service centers and (2) *Baomu* and *jia zheng* coordination centers.

Community Service Centers. Between late 1990 and early 2000, the Shanghai Municipal Civil Affairs Bureau asked each street station committee to establish a community service center. Currently, almost all 99 street stations in Shanghai have established such centers. The Civil Affairs Bureau sponsors the community service centers, but local street station committees often contribute office facilities and equipment. The purpose of the community service centers is to serve the various needs of the residents of the local community. The types of services provided vary across community service centers in Shanghai. Common services provided to elders include long-term care, shopping, home maintenance, and information and referral services. Some centers provide psychological or legal counseling to elders. Counseling is generally achieved through several visits per month by one or two professionals (typically, retired professionals) to the local community center where the elders and/or families receive assistance from the visiting professionals at the center. Among the 39 community agencies surveyed, 20 (51%) provided counseling services and 24 (62%) offered legal services. Beyond access to professional services, some centers provide direct care services to assist elders with limitations in performing activities of daily living. For example, 14 (36%) agencies surveyed provided meals-on-wheels to elders in the community, while 16 (41%) provided grocery delivery services, which are usually provided by part-time employees of community service centers. For those elders requiring more intensive services, the agency assists with the identification and placement of non-agency workers who provide day-to-day care. The agency does not employ a large number of frontline workers to meet the care needs but acts as an intermediary between the elder and caregiver, with the caregiver being employed directly by the elder or the elder's family. These caregivers, referred to as *baomu* (housemaids), perform a wide range of services depending on the requests of the elders and their families. Services may range from providing assistance with personal care tasks such as bathing, feeding, and walking to household chores such as shopping, cooking, and cleaning. *Baomu* also commonly provide social support to elders, including accompanying elders during medical visits and providing companionship.

Bao Mu and Jia Zheng (Homemaker) Coordination Centers/Service Centers. In addition to the government-supported community service centers, private organizations called *baomu* and *jia zheng* coordination centers facilitate the placement of caregivers. There are two types of *baomu* and *jia zheng* coordination centers. The first type includes non-profit agencies affiliated with street station committees, neighborhood committees, or semi-government organizations such as Labor Unions or Women's Federations. The second type includes private and for-profit organizations. According to some estimates, there are close to 1,000 *baomu* and *jia zheng* coordination centers/companies in Shanghai (Hua, 2003). Most *baomu* coordination centers and *jia zheng* service centers/companies operate on a small-scale, typically employing only two to three staff members, while a few *Jia zheng* companies have as many as 40 to 50 employees. The primary function of these centers is to provide coordination between clients (non-elders may also be served) and the *baomu/jia zheng*. Although *baomu* coordination centers provide similar services, as do the *jia zheng* centers, the centers largely serve two different populations. Elders are the main clients served by the *baomu* centers, while *jia zheng* centers primarily target younger, wealthy families, and any elders who reside in the home.

TABLE 1. Structure of the Organizations Providing Community-Based Long-Term Care in Shanghai, China

	Types of Organizations	Administration	Services Provided	Financing	Primary Sources of Frontline Workers
I. Community-Based Agencies	Community Services Centers	Operated by staff from street station, neighborhood committee	Psychological or legal counseling, meals-on-wheels, and/or grocery delivery	Key administrative staff and office is supported by the Civil Affairs Bureau and street station, neighborhood committee. Have modest amount of government funding to support small percent of elders. Charge coordination fees for other personal and office costs.	Migrant workers, laid off local workers, and retired workers
	<i>Bao Mu</i> ¹ / <i>Jia Zheng</i> ² Coordination Centers	Affiliated with street station, neighborhood committee, or semi-government organization such as trade unions and women's federations	Various home care services based on elders and their families' requests	Office space is partly or completely supported by the affiliated organizations. Charge coordination fees for personal, office space, and office costs.	Primarily are migrant workers, with a small percentage as local laid-off workers
		Private-run organizations	Same as above	Business depends on coordination fees.	Same as above
II. Institutes	Government-Sponsored Institutes	Affiliated with the Civil Affairs Bureau	Adult day care, Send workers to provide household services at elders' homes	Sponsored by the Civil Affairs Bureau. Charge fees for adult day care participation and service delivery fees.	Agency employees, some are migrant workers
	Private, Non-Government Sponsored Institutes	Private-run organizations	Adult day care	Charge fees for adult day care participation and service delivery fees.	Agency employees, many are migrant workers

Note: ¹Housemaid, ²Homemaker

Residential Care Facilities

Government-Sponsored Agencies. In Shanghai, there are four municipal-level government-sponsored residential care facilities for elders, and there are one or two facilities in each of the 18 districts. Most of the street station committees have a small residential care facility. The staff generally includes physicians, nurses, home health aides, and cleaning personnel. Previously, these residential care facilities served as social welfare institutions and only accepted elders who met *all* of the following criteria: Childless, no regular income, widowed/never married, and living alone. During the past decade, these institutions have begun to serve a wider range of elders, including those with and without functional limitations, and those elders willing and able to pay for such services. In the past two years, these residential facilities have also begun to provide community-based services to elders and their families. A few have started meals-on-wheels and homemaker programs, although on-site adult day care is the most common program. In 1999, there were 162 adult day care centers, providing care for 1,334 older people in Shanghai (Shanghai Committee on Aging, 1999). All of the institutions interviewed reported having adult day care programs, while one reported having meals-on-wheels and homemaker programs. The Shanghai First Residential Home for Elders, for example, has an adult day care center, and every day the facility provides

transportation for 10- 15 local healthy elders who spend the day at the facility. Participants generally have access to reading materials, television, movies, informal socialization, and exercise activities, while structured activities are limited. Medical screening services are occasionally provided, but because these services have begun only recently, they are provided sporadically.

Private Non-Government Sponsored Nursing Facilities for Elders. Since the end of the 1980s, along with the economic reforms and increasing size of the aging population, private non-government sponsored elder care organizations have been established in Shanghai. A couple of these have recently opened adult day care centers. Golden Gulf Elder Services Center is one of the most well-known non-government funded nursing facilities in Shanghai. Golden Gulf, a nursing home that evolved four years ago from a company facing bankruptcy, has more than 300 residents. In 1999, it opened an adult day care center that now serves 15 community-dwelling elders. Transportation is available to pick up and drop off elders daily. The center has structured activities for elders, such as dancing, Tai Chi, and watching videos. The center also provides lunch and space for elders to rest or take a nap. The facility's administration stated that a potential advantage of this dual arrangement of services allows facility-residing residents to maintain community contacts, while simultaneously providing opportunity for community-dwelling elders to become familiar with the improvements that have been made in residential-based long-term care.

Work Force for CBLTC Services

Administrative Staff. The majority of the administrative personnel working at the various community service centers and adult day care centers are employed by the street committees or local civil affairs bureau. Generally, these employees have no specialized training in social work, nursing, or related fields. In comparison with the administrative staff in residential homes, those working in community service centers tend to be less educated and have less work experience providing services to older adults. The following represents the educational attainment of the 28 administrators working in the residential homes: Master's degree (3%), some post-secondary education (57%), high school only (25%), and middle school only (14%). Among the 43 interviewed from the community service centers, 35% completed some post-secondary education, 44% completed high school, while 14% held only a middle school degree. The average tenure of those working in the field as administrative staff was 6.9 years, while the average length of employment for staff at community service centers and residential homes was 5.5 and 8.7 years, respectively.

Sources of Frontline Workers. The frontline workforce is composed almost entirely of either local workers who have been laid off or migrant workers entering the city from the countryside. Due to rapid economic reforms, a large number of state-run factories have entered bankruptcy or are on the verge of bankruptcy, leaving many workers out of work. Because of the scarcity of available jobs, older workers are being displaced and replaced by younger workers who are perceived as holding preferable skills and higher degrees of education, resulting in many people in their 30s or early 40s being laid-off. In an attempt to encourage the unemployed to work in the long-term care field, Shanghai government agencies, such as Labor, Social Security Bureau, and Women's Federation, offer training at no cost to laid-off workers aged 50 years and younger to be homemakers in the social services field. This type of training is called "jia zheng." Most *jia zheng* training involves basic skills and lasts only one to two days.

While those working as *bao mu* include some local, untrained, laid-off workers, these workers are mostly recently relocated migrant workers. Although *jia zheng* are a growing labor force, the *bao mu* continue to represent the major source of frontline workers in CBLTC. Most of these workers are female, from poor rural areas of two adjacent provinces (*Jiang Su* or *An Hui*), and have had few years of formal education. Workers are typically paid monthly, work full-time for elders and their families, and live in the elder's home. Because the terms of the working arrangement are determined between the elder/family and the *bao mu*, most full time *bao mu* work seven days a week, for shifts that typically last 10 hours a day or more. In comparison, *bao mu* from the local pool of laid-off workers tend to have higher levels of education and more skills; and thus, their working conditions are slightly better. Although training opportunities exist for the laid-off workers, migrant workers must pay several hundred *yuan* to receive comparable training. Thus, most migrant workers receive no training at all.

Only 7% of the community agency representatives surveyed reported that all of the *bao mu* associated with their agencies had received training, while 70% of the agency reported that only some of the *bao mu* had received training. A total of 23% of the agencies reported that none of the *bao mu* had been trained. Similarly, the results from field visits revealed that only a small percentage of *bao mu* in Shanghai had any training (the majority are local workers). Although the overwhelming majority of migrant *bao mu* do not have any training, some female migrant workers are able to find employment at residential care facilities for elders working as nurse aides or homemakers, and they are more likely to receive skills training in comparison with their otherwise similar *bao mu* counterparts working in the community. Of those surveyed, 71% of the respondents from residential care facilities reported that frontline workers in their institution had received training, while 21% reported that at least some of the workers employed at their facility had received training. Only 8% reported that their employees had received no training.

Recruitment and Retention. Although some laid-off workers find employment as caregivers, the majority of local laid-off workers are not willing to work in the long-term care field, primarily because these jobs do not pay well, are labor intensive, and tend to be viewed as having low social status. Survey respondents reported several of these reasons in terms of the relative difficulty in recruiting local workers, including: 56% thought that salaries were too low; 54% reported that the job placements were too labor intensive; 28% thought that adequate respect was lacking. Laid-off workers are discouraged by family members from seeking employment as a *bao mu* because they do not want to “lose face” among neighbors and associates who are aware of their relatives’ poor working status. Only 15% thought that the poor recruitment reflected actual labor supplies.

Despite the surplus of migrant workers, 48% of respondents reported that recruiting *bao mu* workers was difficult. Although the questionnaire provided little insight into this finding, conversations during field visits indicated that while finding migrant workers is easy, recruiting the local and more skilled workers is difficult. This creates a problem because most elders and their family members prefer hiring a local *baomu*. Because of different dialects and cultural backgrounds among mi-grant workers, families believe that local *bao mu* are more likely to share similar cultural backgrounds, customs, and dialect (the vast majority of local residents in Shanghai speak Shanghai dialect). Thus, paradoxically, recruiting and retaining local workers remains a problem while at the same time, high rates of unemployment and poor levels of training continue to exist among the migrant workers.

The monthly salary for full-time *bao mu* ranges from 500 to 600 *yuan* (equivalent to 61 to 73 U.S. dollars), which includes board. Many mi-grant *bao mu* also prefer living in the elder’s house to save rent expenses, which would consume a large percentage of their salary. The wages vary by skills and intensity of the job demands. For part-time *baomu*, the hourly rate typically ranges from 5 to 6 *yuan*. The salary is low in comparison to other jobs in the service sector and with the cost of living in the city. Nonetheless, the amount is sufficient for the migrant workers who often support themselves as well as relatives who remain in the rural areas to live a modest life. Primarily in their 20s or 30s, these *bao mu* will most likely remain in the profession for a long period of time, reflecting their lack of education and marketable skills, which, thus, prevent them from obtaining employment in other sectors.

However, there is high turnover among *bao mu*, across agencies and between families, depending on employers’ needs and how well the *baomu* can meet the elder’s expectations. Currently, there are no rules and regulations that apply to the *bao mu* labor market. Once the community service centers or private *bao mu* coordination centers introduce elders and *bao mu*, the *bao mu* will start working after the two parties reach an informal agreement in terms of salary and working schedule.

Financing of CBLTC

The local civil affairs bureau and street station committees support community services centers by providing office space and supporting key administrative staff. Many *bao mu/jia zheng* coordination centers are also partially supported by street station committees or their affiliated semi-government organizations such as labor unions and women’s organizations. Except for a few agencies that charge administrative fees to their *bao mu* or *jia zheng*,

most agencies depend on the coordination fees that they charge to *bao mu* and elders for their personnel and daily office costs. Many private agencies rely exclusively on one-time coordination fees to support their businesses. Typically, both clients and *bao mu* pay 10 *yuan* to the agencies as the coordination fee except for a few. Elders also pay fees for services ranging from 5 *yuan* for each meal delivered by a community service center to 14 *yuan* per day for those attending adult day care. The vast majority of elders and/or their families hire *bao mu/jiazheng* and pay out-of-pocket expenses for other community services for elders. There is little in the way of government funding available to subsidize care for the elders and their families.

In 2000, China's Department of Civil Affairs initiated a "Xing Guang (Star Light) Project." The department allocated 20% of the social welfare lottery money for building community service centers and helping with the costs of home care for poor and frail elders. Most of the money was spent on building centers; a small portion of the money was allocated to provide direct services to frail elders. There are several eligibility criteria for receiving assistance from this plan. Frail elders must be (1) in extreme poverty; (2) with no regular income, no children, and no former work unit; or (3) a retired worker who has made a great contribution to society in the past (Shanghai Civil Affairs Bureau, 2002). For those who meet any of the criteria, and depending on their individual needs, the community service centers will pay 50% to 100% of the cost associated with the services provided by the *bao mu*. However, only a small fraction of the elders meet any of the eligibility criteria. During the principal investigator's field trips to these street community centers, it was found on average only one out of 800 to 1,000 elders (less than 1%) in each street committee received funding to hire home care service providers.

Outreach and Quality Management

There are several ways for agencies to reach elders residing in the community. In general, community-based organizations have provided more outreach than residential homes. In Shanghai, almost all residents live in apartment buildings. Most of the street and neighborhood committees put a blackboard in the main entrance of the buildings or some other visible place in the community to announce community activities and services. The majority (88%) of the community organizations interviewed reported that they used this approach to announce services they provide. More than half (57%) of the residential homes also contact nearby local communities and ask them to use similar approaches. Flyers with relevant information distributed to the homes of elders is another way for outreach; 56% of the agencies interviewed reported using this outreach method. Some organizations send staff on home visits to frail elders in need of some services. Fifty-four percent of the community-based organizations and 32% of the institutions reported that they provide this type of outreach service. Use of a telephone is also a way to reach elders. Many community services centers have established a hotline for residents, providing information and referral services. When elders and their family members call in to ask about availability of services, the staff provides information to them. Thirty-two percent of the agencies in the study conduct outreach by telephone hotline.

To date, the monitoring of care provided by *bao mu* or community agencies is accomplished primarily on an ad hoc basis. Jinan Shi District Community Services Center for Elders is one of the successfully run models in Shanghai. The center has served 2,700 elders with coordinating services between *bao mu* and elders/families since it was established in May 1999. Elders and/or their families pay the *bao mu* salary directly and the center charges a monthly 15% fee of the *bao mu*'s salary with 5% from *bao mu*, and 10% from elders and/or their families. The center's staff members call or visit elders monthly to monitor the quality of care provided by the *bao mu* and to act as mediators if conflicts arise between the two parties. The majority of the community agencies do not have a systematic mechanism for monitoring care. Among the 43 respondents from community services centers, 63% reported that their agencies conduct home visits, with varying frequency across agencies, from once every month to once every several months. Others do not conduct home visits unless they receive complaints from the clients or their families.

Requesting an evaluation from the clients and their families is another way community agencies monitor quality. Thirty-seven percent of the respondents from the community centers reported using this approach. These types of evaluations are informal. Most of the time, staff members make a telephone call to check whether *bao mu* is getting along with elders and their families. The results from the field visits revealed that within many

agencies, staff members make the visits only when a conflict arises between elders and *bao mu*. Ten out of 39 community service centers (26%) have no quality monitoring mechanisms. Evaluating quality of care by asking elders in-person is the most common method for residential care facilities. Sixty-eight per-cent of the administrative staff from the residential homes reported using this method of supervising care. However, 18% also reported having home visits. While the survey was conducted mostly among the staff at government-sponsored community services centers and residential care facilities, the majority of the private *bao mu* coordination centers do not monitor quality of care.

Assessment of elders' health and functional status is more common among residential care settings than among community-based agencies. Among those interviewed, 53% of the community services centers and 82% of the residential homes reported that they have someone to evaluate elders' health status and needs before they provide services. While many residential care facilities have simple forms for staff to fill out before admission, the most common criteria adult day care centers use are that elders should have no symptoms of mental illness or dementia, no infectious diseases, and should be physically mobile.

The assessments for community services agencies are preliminary and vary across the agencies, which are primarily based on personal observation. Not all agencies conduct health assessments. Among those community services centers that evaluate the health status of the elders, the most common procedure is a home visit.

Community-based care for elders in urban China is in its initial stage of development. Many services and programs are not available or have not fully developed to meet elders' needs. When asked whether the services they provided have met elders' needs, no respondents reported that services have fully met elders' needs. Seventy per-cent of them reported that services "partially met" elders' needs, 30% reported "not met" or "not at all met." The most frequently cited unmet needs are (1) elders need services and care, but they cannot afford these; (2) no financial resources to develop more programs and services for elders, such as adult day care centers, senior centers and nursing homes; and (3) more psychological counseling.

DISCUSSION

This paper provides a systematic analysis of the current status of the emerging services for CBLTC system in Shanghai, China. It covers several domains of the system including service delivery, workforce, financing, and quality-of-care management. Given the complexity of the system, we make an attempt to evaluate the CBLTC and hope to stimulate more discussion and draw attention to China's emerging long-term care system.

Training the Long-Term Care Workforce

An important issue facing China's long-term care delivery system is the lack of a trained workforce. The Chinese government has begun to realize that there is a great demand for frontline workers in the long-term care field and is aware of the importance of training frontline workers. Some government agencies, such as the labor union, the department of health, and the Women's Federation, are training laid-off workers to work in long-term care. However, these training programs are short-term and do not cover much basic caregiving skills training. Caring for frail elders can be a complicated task, requiring people with nursing skills, social and psychological knowledge, and training in basic ethics. A program with a broader range of skills and knowledge-based training should be adopted to train various levels of frontline workforce. A recent survey conducted in four Chinese cities found that among those who had hired *bao mu* in the past, 61 % were not satisfied with the quality of care *bao mu* provided for elders. The main reason of their lack of satisfaction was that *bao mu* were perceived as lacking necessary care-related skills for elders (China's Urban Family Consumption Survey, 2001). Not only do the *bao mu* lack important skills; our study also indicates that many administrative staff also lack training. As China gradually develops its formal community-based elder care system, it is essential for frontline workers and administrative staff to receive adequate, content-based training to ensure the quality of care for elders.

Implementing Quality Management Mechanism

Implementing a quality management mechanism is an important part of any long-term care system. While training frontline workers might be the most important part of the strategy for improving quality of care, implementation of a quality management mechanism includes, in part, identifying and enacting regulatory supervision of the services provided by *bao mu*, establishing a regular quality monitoring system, and implementing standard health assessments of clients.

Setting Up Regulations and Rules

The study revealed that once the community service centers or private *bao mu* coordination centers introduce elders and *bao mu*, it is up to these two parties to reach an informal agreement in terms of salary and working schedule. This arrangement can cause potential harm to both the elder and *bao mu*. Since no regulations have been enacted in the long-term care field, no employee/employer contract is required, and often workers abandon their jobs, leaving elders and their families scrambling to find replacements. Conversely, workers' rights can easily be violated because there is no protection of these rights. At the current stage, the centers could develop a standard agreement for use by elders and/or their families engaging *baomu*. More standard regulations and rules should be developed when China is developing more large-scale and formal arrangements in urban areas.

Establishing a Regular Quality Monitoring System

To date, no systematic quality control mechanism has been put in place to cover this emerging sector. Most quality control mechanisms are quite loose and/or implemented in an ad hoc manner. Without this mechanism in place, elder abuse and neglect may occur. More stringent quality control, such as closer supervision and standardized quality evaluation procedures, are needed to ensure quality care. In addition, the centers can develop their role as third-party intermediaries between elders and *bao mu* by promoting standard agreements that include functions, such as dispute resolution, that the centers can perform for both parties.

Implementation of Standard Health Assessment Measures

The study found no implementation of comprehensive and standard health assessments to evaluate elders' health status and needs for services in the community in Shanghai. Requiring standard health measures may not be seen as a priority at the current stage, since the vast majority of elders and their families hire *bao mu* at their own expense, and the services performed depend almost entirely on the request of the elders and their families. Although elders' health status is one of the eligibility criteria for limited public funding, the public subsidy for elder services is largely based on other criteria. As more elder services are developed and more public funding is available, standard health measures should be used as a main criterion to allocate public funding and to ensure the provision of appropriate services to meet elders' needs.

Expanding Functions for Adult Day Care Centers

Currently, there is a low attendance rate for many newly established day care centers. Most of the day care centers do not have transportation available, and the cost for attending is relatively high. Given the limited activities provided in the centers, elders and their families would rather hire a part-time *bao mu* at home, instead of going to day care centers. The functions of day care centers should be expanded better to serve elders in local communities. In addition to providing respite for families, day care centers can include many services and programs, for example, practical care services such as providing medical monitoring services periodically, and providing health-related information through work-shops and brochures; social activities, both structured and unstructured; and transportation services.

Increasing Government Investment in Social Services

While the Chinese government has started to allocate more funding to the long-term care field, public funding is still limited. To date, except for a small fraction of elders of whom the majority are childless, the responsibility of caring for frail elders has fallen almost exclusively on elders' families. For elders without sufficient financial resources for hiring a *bao mu* and whose adult children are working full-time, their care needs are largely unmet in the community. The income disparity, as a result of the economic reform, has contributed to, in part, an increasing number of the elders and/or their families who cannot afford to purchase the services for elders. With little

government or public funding available, support of social services is a serious issue in China's long-term care program and will become more serious in the future. Currently, most Chinese adult children have other siblings to share filial responsibilities and share the costs of elder services; thus, the financial burden will most likely be more severe in the future when single-child adult families will predominate.

China has undergone a dramatic social and economic development during the last two decades, but economic development remains a major emphasis of the Chinese government. As Olson (1993) pointed out, the dilemma in China is how resources should be allocated among the competing needs of youth, elder care, supporting family stability, and continued economic growth. Currently, as the Chinese government is trying to establish a new social welfare system to serve its population better, especially the needy and underserved, more financial resources must be channeled into a long-term care program.

This study conducted a systematic analysis of current status and issues of the CBLTC in Shanghai. Our findings provide some insights into the general patterns of long-term care in urban China and issues surrounding its further development. Although Shanghai undoubtedly has some unique characteristics as the most developed urban center in China, certain generalizations can be drawn from the emerging system. Ways of improving workforce training, quality management and oversight, co-ordination of services, and financing of long-term care all represent critical ventures facing all of urban China as it struggles to meet the needs of the fastest growing elder population in the world. While these aspects are probably similar across urban settings, other important differences most likely exist. For example, the ad hoc nature of emergence of CBLTC, coupled with the current role of local government in financing options, most likely has resulted in unique responses across urban areas. Further, in comparison with the long-term care systems in urban areas, development of the CBLTC system in rural areas may face other, different challenges.

REFERENCES

- Bartlett, H., & Phillips, D. R. (1997). Ageing and aged care in the People's Republic of China: National and local issues and perspectives. *Health & Place*, 3(3): 149-159. *Beijing Review* (1987). *Remarriage of the elderly*, 30(5-6): 37 (Chinese).
- Chappell, N. (2003). Family care of seniors in Shanghai: Similarities and differences with the West. In Z. X. Shen, S. X. Gui, J. M. Zhu, & P. B. Sun (Eds.), *2nd International Symposium on Chinese Elderly* (pp. 943-964). Shanghai, China: Hua Ling Publisher (Chinese).
- China's Urban Family Consumption Survey (2001). Retrieved October 3, 2003 from <http://www.cctv.com/lm/345/127/33907.html> (Chinese).
- Elders' Protection Law of People's Republic of China (1996). Retrieved on Sept 5, 2003 from <http://cnolder.com/zhengce/0.htm> (Chinese).
- Harbaugh, C. W., & West, L. A. (1993). Aging trends—China. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Gerontology*, 8: 271-280.
- Hua, J. F. (2003). *Bao Mu* as a Mark for Wealth: Shanghai Needs High Quality "House-keepers." *Jie Fang Daily*, January 6, 2003 (Chinese).
- Ikels, C. (1990). New options for the urban elderly. In D. Davis & E. Vogel (Eds.), *Chinese Society on the Eve of Tiananmen* (pp. 215-242). Cambridge: The Council on East Asian Studies/Harvard University.
- Li, P. L. (2001). Psychological Impact of the Income Polarization. *Jiangsu Social Sciences*, 3. (Chinese).
- Liang, J., & Gu, S. (1989). Long-term care for the elderly in China. In T. Schwab (Ed.), *Caring for an Aging World: International Models for Long-Term Care, Financing, and Delivery* (pp. 265-287). New York: McGraw-Hill.
- National Bureau of Statistics of China (2003). Statistics Bulletin of 2002 (Chinese). National Bureau of Statistics of China (2002a). Cross-province migration population exceeded 40 million in China. Retrieved on Sept. 17, 2003 from <http://www.stats.gov.cn> (Chinese).
- National Bureau of Statistics of China (2002b). Retrieved on May 31, 2003 from <http://www.stats.gov.cn/tjfx/ztfx/zgsnrjzs/200206280067.htm> (Chinese).
- National Population and Family Planning Commission of China (2003). Retrieved on April 27, 2004 from <http://www.sfpc.gov.cn/cn/data/sfpcdata2004-1-30-1.htm> (Chinese).

- Olson, P. (1994). The changing role of the elderly in the People's Republic of China. In L. K. Olson (Ed.), *The Graying of the World: Who Will Care for the Frail Elderly?* (pp. 261-287). New York: The Haworth Press, Inc.
- Olson, P. (1993). Caregiving and long-term health care in the People's Republic of China. *Journal of Aging & Social Policy*, 5(1/2): 91-110.
- Olson, P. (1987). A model of eldercare in the People's Republic of China. *International Journal of Aging & Human Development*, 24(4): 279-300.
- Shanghai Civil Affairs Bureau (2002). Building a multilevel and multiform network of care for elders at home—Report on care for elders at home. Government document (Chinese).
- Shanghai Committee on Aging (1999). Statistical Report on the Basic Conditions of Elder Welfare Services in Shanghai in 1999 (Chinese).
- Shanghai Fifth Census Office (2001). *Report on Population Development in Shanghai*. September 2001 (Chinese).
- Shanghai Research Center on Aging (2004). Report on Population Aging in Shanghai. Retrieved on June 28, 2004 from <http://www.shrca.org.cn/text/readnews.asp?id=1643> (Chinese).
- Shanghai Statistical Bureau (2001). Shanghai: Migrant Population Reached 3.87 million. Retrieved on Sept. 17, 2003 from <http://www.sfpcc.gov.cn/cn/localnews2001/1211-1.htm> (Chinese).
- Wu, B., Silverstein, N. M., Axelrod, D., Zhu, J. M., Song, P. P. & Shou, L. L. (2002). *Cross-Cultural Comparison of the Oldest Old in Shanghai and Boston: Their Lifestyles and Contributions*. Paper presented at the 55th Annual Scientific Meeting of the Gerontological Society of America, November 2002, Boston, MA.
- Xin Hua News Agency (2003). The services for elders in empty nest family being neglected. Retrieved on September 17, 2003 from http://www.icareyou.com/index.php?page=news.php&news_id=18 (Chinese).
- Xin Min Weekly (2002). *New Shanghai creating new adventure*. September 30, 2002 (Chinese).
- Yang, Q. H. (1988). The aging of China's population: Perspectives and implications. *Asia-Pacific Population Journal*, 3(1): 55-75.
- Yang, Z. H., & Xiao, Z. Y. (1996). Migrating population versus urbanization. *Population and Economics*, 5: 33-38 (Chinese).
- Yuan, T. H., Zhang, T., Ping, Y., Li, J., & Liang, Z. (1992). China's demographic dilemmas. *Population Bulletin*, 47:1-44.
- Yue, S. D. (2001). The trend of population aging in China. *Social Security System*, 5. (Chinese).
- Zeng, Y., Vaupel, J. W., Xiao, Z. Y., & Liu, Y. Z. (2002). Sociodemographic and health profiles of the oldest old in China. *Population and Development Review*, 28(2): 251-273.
- Zhao, Y. (2003). Some Thoughts About the Relationship between Economic Growth and Employment Rate. Shanghai Statistics Bureau. Retrieved September 30, 2003 from <http://www.stats-sh.gov.cn/2003shtj/tjfx/ztbg0.htm?dl=zbtg/zbtg030809-01.htm> (Chinese).