Typically, teachers of private instrumental lessons and large ensembles rely on a method book to supplement instruction regarding the fundamentals of music. The method books chosen by these instructors differ due to the nature of the teaching environments. Numerous books have been written specifically for the varied structure of these learning environments, to address various philosophies and approaches. This led to the development of method books specifically used in either private lessons or large ensemble settings.

One of the most integral elements of music found in these method books is rhythm. The purpose of this study is to present comparative data related to the content and sequencing of rhythmic instruction in beginning flute method books for both private lesson and large ensemble environments. Four books intended for each instructional setting were used to provide the data for this study. The comprehensive band method books analyzed were Essential Elements for Band, Tradition of Excellence, Sound Innovations, and Measure of Success. The solo flute methods analyzed were:


Each book was analyzed to determine the graphic layout, number, type, and sequencing of rhythmic concepts included throughout the methods. After reviewing each of these elements of rhythmic instruction, it was determined that a universal method for teaching rhythm did not exist among method books. The analysis produced data that reflected differences in the approach to rhythmic instruction between the two types of books. The information supported the potential for a difference in rhythm instruction to occur between the method books used in heterogeneous band and private flute learning environments. Ultimately, an analysis of the method books was presented with the intention to assist teachers in the creation and implementation of complimentary instructional techniques.

---


TEACHING RHYTHM: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF BEGINNING BAND AND SOLO FLUTE METHOD BOOKS

by

Amanda K. Mitchell

A Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of The Graduate School at The University of North Carolina at Greensboro in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree Doctor of Musical Arts

Greensboro 2017

Approved by

Committee Chair
This dissertation, written by Amanda K. Mitchell, has been approved by the following committee of the Faculty of The Graduate School at The University of North Carolina at Greensboro.

Committee Chair ________________________________

Committee Members ________________________________

______________________________

Date of Acceptance by Committee

______________________________

Date of Final Oral Examination
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**LIST OF TABLES** ............................................................................................................... v

**LIST OF FIGURES** ........................................................................................................... vi

**CHAPTER**

I. **INTRODUCTION** ........................................................................................................ 1
   
   Statement of Purpose ................................................................. 2
   Definition of Terms ......................................................................... 2
   Limitations of the Study ............................................................... 3

II. **SURVEY OF RELATED LITERATURE** ............................................................... 5
   
   Rhythm Acquisition ........................................................................ 5
   Pedagogical Articles on Rhythm Acquisition .............................. 6
   Research Articles on Rhythmic Acquisition ............................... 8
   Method Books ................................................................................. 10

III. **METHOD** ............................................................................................................. 14

IV. **RESULTS** ............................................................................................................... 17
   
   Rhythmic Concepts ......................................................................... 17
   Number of Rhythmic Concepts .................................................. 20
   Sequencing of Concepts ............................................................. 20
   Graphic Layout ............................................................................... 22

V. **DISCUSSION** ........................................................................................................... 24
   
   Comparative Analysis of Rhythms Included .............................. 24
   Comparative Analysis of the Sequencing of Rhythmic Concepts .... 26
   Comparative Analysis of Graphic Layout and Organization ........ 26

VI. **CONCLUSIONS AND ASSESSMENT** ............................................................. 32
   
   Conclusions .................................................................................... 32
   Assessment ...................................................................................... 33
LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1a</td>
<td>Rhythmic Concepts Included in Solo Flute Method Books</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1b</td>
<td>Rhythmic Concepts Included in Comprehensive Band Method Books</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Number of Concepts Included in Method Books</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a</td>
<td>Sequencing of Concepts in Solo Flute Method Books</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b</td>
<td>Sequencing of Concepts in Comprehensive Band Methods</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4a</td>
<td>Concept Introductions in Solo Flute Methods</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4b</td>
<td>Concept Introductions in Comprehensive Band Methods</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>Rubank Elementary Method Graphic</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Flute 101: Mastering the Basics Graphic</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Sound Innovations Graphic</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>Essential Elements Graphic</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>Tradition of Excellence Graphic</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

When school-aged children become interested in learning to play an instrument, initial instruction usually occurs in large ensemble settings or in private lessons. Through these two environments, students receive training in foundational musical skills, such as producing a characteristic tone, developing basic technical proficiency, reading notation, and understanding rhythm. Typically, teachers request each student have a method book to supplement the lessons being taught. However, due to the nature of both teaching environments, the method books that private instructors and large ensemble instructors select are different. Several books have been written specifically for the varied structure of these learning environments, to address various philosophies and approaches. This led to the development of method books specifically used in either private lessons or large ensemble settings.

A variety of approaches for developing fundamental music skills are used in conjunction with the method books for both settings. Although specific approaches may suit the context of the book in which they appear, a dichotomy is present between the instructional techniques presented in the method books used by large, heterogeneous ensembles and those in private lessons. One example of such a dichotomy is the process used to teach students rhythm. Rhythm is one of the most integral parts of music instruction, and the knowledge of its function is critical to the development of reading
music. Students may struggle with rhythm initially and continue to carry a deficiency as their music studies progress. Although it seems beneficial to have access to various method books, each presenting diverse techniques for teaching rhythm, the instructional variety has the potential to be confusing or overwhelming to the student. Through the recognition of inconsistencies in the presentation of rhythmic instruction across large ensemble and solo instrumental method books, teachers will gain the potential to alleviate inconsistencies pertaining to rhythmic development.

**Statement of Purpose**

The purpose of this study is to present comparative data related to the content and sequencing of rhythm instruction in beginning flute method books for both private lesson and large ensemble environments. The information gathered from these sources is compared to present conclusions associated with the approaches to teaching rhythm in heterogeneous large ensemble settings and in private lessons. A study comparing whether differences exist between rhythm instruction in method books for large ensembles and private lessons will establish a direct line of inquiry connecting teachers in both instructional settings.

**Definition of Terms**

In this study, there are four specific terms that warrant clarification: *rhythm*, *method book*, *aspect*, and *concept*.

1. *Rhythm*—the organization of notes relative to time and duration. For the purpose of this study, steady beat and pulse were not examined as a part of rhythmic instruction.
2. *Method book*—a book intended to provide students with pedagogical information related to instrumental performance fundamentals. Method books provide exercises to reinforce tone and technical developments, guide students through a progression of studies, and to build a strong foundation in instrumental performance skills.

3. *Aspect*—a categorization of the rhythmic elements seen throughout the method books. When used, this term refers to the overarching categories of time signature, note duration, and rest duration.

4. *Concept*—individual rhythmic elements, associated with time signature, note duration, or rest duration. For example, a quarter note, quarter rest, or the 4/4 time signature can be classified as a rhythmic concept.

**Limitations of the Study**

Due to the specific nature of this comparative study, a few limitations are present. Only method books for beginning flute instruction commonly used in the United States are referenced. These are limited to four popular books designed as comprehensive beginning band methods and four popular books for beginning private flute instruction. Although these books typically cover an array of pedagogical topics for beginning flutists, only materials directly associated with rhythm are studied.

The aspects of rhythm studied are limited to note values, rests, and time signatures. Information regarding maintaining a steady beat or pulse is not included. Although the acquisition of skills related to understanding steady beat or pulse is fundamental to the understanding of rhythm, few of the chosen method books provided
instruction related to this topic. If the method book chose to include information about steady beat, sparse details were included regarding the acquisition of the particular skill. Additionally, the information provided in this study is strictly limited to the instructional content provided within the method books. Instruction provided directly by a teacher is beyond the scope of this study.
CHAPTER II
SURVEY OF RELATED LITERATURE

Two distinct areas of related research were considered: beginning experiences regarding the acquisition of rhythm skills and band method books. Extant publications typically explored these two topics as separate entities, and have not shown readers how they were connected. Existing research provided information to classroom or large ensemble music teachers, however, this same research was typically not directed towards private studio teachers.

Rhythm Acquisition

A number of publications, both pedagogical and research driven, conveyed various teaching philosophies associated with building a student’s understanding of rhythm. The majority of the pedagogical articles provided current classroom teachers with instructional strategies for teaching and reinforcing rhythmic concepts. The research articles investigated the efficacy of various approaches to teaching rhythm. In general, however, authors have not provided teachers with an analysis of the most popular approaches to teaching rhythm for beginning instruction. Also, the primary focus of research of this kind was related to rhythm instruction in classroom and large ensemble settings rather than private lessons.
Pedagogical Articles on Rhythm Acquisition

One categorical subset present across a number of the pedagogical articles examined pertained to the development of rhythmic skills in school-aged musicians. In the article *Strings Got Rhythm: A Guide to Developing Rhythmic Skills in Beginners*, Charlene Dell addressed the issues that string students encounter when trying to execute both proper technique and good rhythmic skills while reading music. She proposed that changing the sequence of instruction could potentially alleviate the rhythmic deficiencies seen in beginning string players.9

Furthermore, the article, *Start with Rhythms and Tapping When Beginners Learn to Read* by Kevin Mixon provided methods for introducing and integrating rhythmic skill development. Mixon emphasized the importance of setting the understanding of rhythm before convoluting instruction with the learning of pitches. Another point stressed in this article was that large muscle movements helped in acquiring a sense of rhythm.10

Numerous articles also focused on the effects of specific instructional methods that could be instilled in the music classroom. David Roe presented an instructional method in his article *Teaching Rhythm with Games*. Three group activities were highlighted in this article for teaching high school level band and orchestra students. The first two exercises were highlighted as being appropriate for use as a warm up and the last activity could be used as a more in depth classroom activity for skill development. Each

---


of the activities was developed to enhance the students’ creativity and understanding of rhythm.\(^{11}\)

Another instructional method was described in the article, *How to Think Rhythms* by W. Otto Miesener. Miesener told stories of faulty rhythmic execution by professional musicians, and how the mind can remember specific rhythm patterns. Miesener recommended the use of musical mnemonics to help in the perception of characteristic beat rhythms. He stated that using “tone-words” (phrases or words spoken in association with a specific rhythmic pattern) were the most useful form of remembering certain rhythmic patterns because “words are the tools of thought.”\(^{12}\)

Additionally, three articles pertaining to rhythm acquisition provided specific techniques for delivering rhythm instruction and reinforcing a student’s understanding of rhythm. Albert Stoutmire’s article *Teaching Rhythmic Notation*, recommended a method of rhythm instruction related to developing understanding through the creation of “time units”. The units were described as representing the pulse in the music, and were discovered through the act of score analysis. Stoutmire recommended the development of time units to alleviate the difficulty in reading complex rhythms.\(^{13}\) There was no clear evidence that this strategy has been used more recently.

Furthermore, Dean Dixon, in his article, *Solving Rhythmic Problems*, recognized that rhythm was one of the most common difficulties encountered by musicians. Dixon


proposed a new system of counting rhythms that could potentially assist students. This three-step system instructed students to disregard time signature, to use the “fastest frequently occurring note” as the counting unit, and to count backwards. The author stated that this system was successful among a variety of ensembles and with students of various ages and abilities who were playing in a variety of ensembles.14

Finally, James Warrick’s article Ideas for Teaching Rhythm, suggested that rhythm should be approached through subdivision and duration. The primary goal of this article was to emphasize the importance of why musicians should mentally count subdivisions of the beat while playing long notes. This article also included various examples of ways that different subdivisions should be counted for measures containing various rhythmic patterns.15

**Research Articles on Rhythmic Acquisition**

Patricia Shehan Campbell’s study, Rhythmic Movement and Public School Music Education: Conservative and Progressive Views of the Formative Years, examined two approaches to the idea of rhythmic movement. This research study established how rhythm became an essential part of the music education curriculum within the school system. At the time of this article’s publication, “conservative thinkers” believed that rhythmic abilities were naturally inherited. A number of “progressive thinkers” instilled


activities related specifically to rhythm into the curriculum, and perpetuated an awareness of its importance in early music education.\(^\text{16}\)

Various approaches to the effects of rhythm reading have also been analyzed. Erik Johnson analyzed a method for enhancing rhythm-reading achievement in his article, *The Effect of Peer-Based Instruction on Rhythm Reading Achievement*. In this study, it was noted that students who received peer-based instruction demonstrated higher levels of rhythm reading achievement than students who received traditional instruction (i.e. instruction provided in the classroom by a single teacher). These results were even more apparent when used in a choral setting.\(^\text{17}\) Furthermore, Kenneth Smith presented a study related to another instructional method of teaching rhythmic skills in his article, *The Effect of Computer Assisted Instruction and Field Independence on the Development of Rhythm Sight-Reading Skills of Middle School Instrumental Students*. At the conclusion of the study, no evidence supported the idea computer assistance helped students when learning rhythm or improving rhythmic skills.\(^\text{18}\)

Finally, an analysis of different instructional methods was provided in the study, *The Effect of Two Beginning Band Instructional Approaches on Rhythm Achievement* written by M. Christina Schneider. Two test groups were used in this study; one group


\(^{17}\) Erik A. Johnson, “The Effect of Peer-Based Instruction on Rhythm Reading Achievement,” *Contributions to Music Education* 38, no. 2 (2011): 43-60.

received instruction while listening to a musical accompaniment and one group did not. At the conclusion of the study, the author determined that background accompaniments had no effect on learning to read rhythms or improvise patterns.\(^\text{19}\)

In summary, articles about rhythmic instruction have introduced readers to specific effects on rhythm learning, and the development of rhythm learning in the classroom. These studies introduced classroom teachers to new instructional methods, which allowed flexibility in approach to teaching rhythm, specific to student learning styles and the classroom environment.

**Method Books**

Existing research of method books primarily provided a review of the content or an analysis pertaining to specific standards, such as comprehensive musicianship or the National Standards of Music Education.\(^\text{20}\) These studies provided a great deal of information useful for the classroom band instructor by increasing awareness of the content and instructional techniques found in many band method books.

Of the articles examined, three were found to provide information regarding the content of specific method books. James Byo provided a detailed analysis of selected class methods in his article, *Beginning Band Instruction: A Comparative Analysis of Selected Class Methods*. Byo gave a clear outline of the content, and this included: tonal content, rhythmic content, harmonization, duets and rounds, physical features, and instrument selection considerations. Based upon the findings, Byo determined that when


selecting which book to use, the teacher must center their decision on whether or not a specific book complements their personal teaching philosophy. He also determined that a book with the ability to meet the needs of every instructor has yet to be written.21

*Many Method Books for Beginning Bands: An Overview of Six Publications*, a pedagogical article by Ely and Stowers, outlined six different band method books based on content and structure. The main purpose of this article was to provide teachers with a synopsis of how each book discussed the development of tonguing, slurring, rhythm, and musical terminology to facilitate them in determining which method book was most appropriate for use in his/her classroom.22

The dissertation written by Stephen Gage titled, *An Analysis and Comparison of Rhythm Instructional Materials and Techniques for Beginning Instrumental Music Students*, provided an analysis of the rhythmic elements found in four comprehensive band method books. The results of this study suggested that a content analysis matrix was effective in reviewing the contents of the book. The matrix identified a variety of pedagogical techniques and similarity between content and sequence between each of the books. In response to these results a generalized system of teaching rhythm was created to develop new instructional material for the method books.23

---


The next category of research focused on the ability of each method book to successfully address specific curricular standards. Tracy Heavner’s dissertation, *An Analysis of Beginning Band Method Books for Principles of Comprehensive Musicianship*, analyzed method books for the inclusion of the principle of comprehensive musicianship. This principle was described as an approach to music as a totality, “with a concern for constituent parts and how they relate to the whole”\(^{24}\). These books were reviewed by professional music educators on the basis of five categories; concepts, content, activities, instructional literature, and evaluation. Based on the data, all current beginning band method books matched various categories of the curriculum model for comprehensive musicianship. The researcher determined that popularly used method books of the written prior to the study lacked comprehensive musicianship skills, and current books (as of 1995) had made significant strides in the inclusion of these concepts.\(^{25}\)

Kie Watkins wrote a dissertation entitled, *An Analysis of Beginning Band Method Books and the Level to Which They Address the National Standards for Music Education*. The researcher selected twelve method books for an analysis of how well each book addressed the National Standards for Music Education\(^{26}\), grades 5-8. Each book met at least two of the standards, and some of the books addressed additional standards.\(^{27}\)


Lastly, a similar purpose was recorded in, *A Review of Beginning Band Method Books for Inclusion of Comprehensive Musicianship and Adherence to the National Standards for Music Education* written by Shannon Paschall. This study included an analysis of five comprehensive band method books. Each method book adhered to the National Standards, however, *Band Expressions* was the only book that included each of the categories reviewed in this study.  

The studies discussed above provided a resourceful comparative guide for teachers in the band classroom. The comparison of music elements, format, and context of skills covered in large ensemble band method books enabled school music teachers to determine which method books were most useful. Although this information may have been beneficial to teachers using comprehensive band method books, it did not provide information or analysis regarding the method books a student may be using for private instruction.

---

27 Kie Watkins, “An Analysis of Select Beginning Band Method Books and the Level to Which They Address the National Standards for Music Education” (Dissertation, Ohio State University, 2011), 213.

CHAPTER III

METHOD

Young children in grades K-5 who have had access to general music instruction at school typically learn rhythm by rote at first. Then, based upon the National Standards for Music Education (PK-8 General Music)\textsuperscript{29}, students progress toward reading rhythmic notation. Method books for beginning band instrumentalists, however, typically include instruction in basic rhythm starting in the first several pages of each book. Therefore, the purpose of this study was to determine how rhythm instruction in private and large group method books was delivered. Rhythm instruction in method books, therefore, assumes students have no knowledge of rhythm prior to playing an instrument despite the fact that students may have had general music in elementary school. The specific research questions were:

1. How does each book present new information?
2. Which rhythmic concepts are included in each method book?
3. What is the sequencing of rhythmic concepts throughout the method books?

The current study employed a qualitative approach, specifically case study. Case study has been utilized to examine individuals, entities, organizations, or events. In this instance, the event that was examined was the facilitation of rhythmic learning through the use of method books in large group and private lessons settings. Thus, a

selection of four private flute method books and four beginning band method books intended for heterogeneous large group instruction and popular in the United States were reviewed for evaluation. Evidence of the content and sequence of rhythmic learning for each book were categorized and compared. Emergent themes, if any, were noted. At the conclusion of the research, a comparative analysis between each of the method books chosen for review was completed.

The method books for large group band instruction were chosen based upon their availability and recent date of publication. Those books were *Essential Elements for Band: Comprehensive Band Method*,\(^{30}\) *Measures of Success: A Comprehensive Band Method*,\(^{31}\) *Sound Innovations for Concert Band: A Revolutionary Method for Beginning Musicians*,\(^{32}\) and *Tradition of Excellence: Comprehensive Band Method*.\(^{33}\)

The solo flute methods were selected based on the esteem of the individual book or the acclaim of the authors in regard to flute pedagogy. *Fluting Stars*\(^ {34}\) was recently recognized by the National Flute Association as a winner of the competition for new published flute methods.\(^ {35}\) *Flute 101: Mastering the Basics*\(^ {36}\) has become one of the most

---

\(^{30}\) Lautzenheiser et al.

\(^{31}\) Sheldon et al., *Measures of Success*.

\(^{32}\) Sheldon et al., *Sound Innovations*.

\(^{33}\) Pearson and Nowlin, *Tradition of Excellence*.

\(^{34}\) Pucihar and Pucihar, *Fluting Stars Book 1*.


\(^{36}\) Louke and George, *Flute 101*. 
well known methods among flute teachers because of the numerous contributions of authors Patricia George and Phyllis Louke related to flute pedagogy. *Beginner’s Book for the Flute*\textsuperscript{37} was also chosen based on the author. Trevor Wye has written an abundance of publications and method books in association with flute instruction, and providing significant contributions to pedagogical resources available for flutists. The final private flute method chosen was *Rubank Elementary Method*.\textsuperscript{38} This method book was selected based upon the esteem and accessibility of the series. *Rubank Elementary Method* was written in 1934, as a series for several different instruments, and continues to serve as a pedagogical resource for private instrumental instructors today.

\textsuperscript{37} Wye, *Beginner’s Book for the Flute*.

\textsuperscript{38} Petersen, *Rubank Elementary Method*. 
CHAPTER IV

RESULTS

Each of the method books used for private and large ensemble instruction contained specific qualities in terms of the graphic layout of the information, the rhythmic content addressed and the sequencing of rhythmic concepts. What follows is a discussion of the scope (graphic layout and content) and sequence of the core rhythmic concepts included within each method book.

Rhythmic Concepts

Generally, the rhythmic concepts reviewed in each of the eight books examined were related to time signature and duration of notes and rests. Within each of these categories, the concepts were introduced and explained in a similar manner specific to the individual methods. Tables 1a and 1b contains a list of the rhythmic concepts included in the private flute and large ensemble method books. The categorized concepts are shown in the order that they appeared within the method book.

Table 1a

Rhythmic Concepts Included in Solo Flute Method Books

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Book</th>
<th>Notes &amp; Rests</th>
<th>Time Signatures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beginner’s Book for Flute</td>
<td>Whole note</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quarter note</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whole rest</td>
<td>Common time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half rest</td>
<td>2/2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 1a

**Cont.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Book</th>
<th>Notes &amp; Rests</th>
<th>Time Signatures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Beginner’s Book for Flute</em></td>
<td>Quarter rest</td>
<td>4/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beamed eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted quarter note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Flute 101</em></td>
<td>Quarter note/rest</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note/rest</td>
<td>Common time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whole note/rest</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eighth note</td>
<td>6/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted quarter note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sixteenth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted eighth, sixteenth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Triplet</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Fluting Stars</em></td>
<td>Whole note/rest</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note/rest</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quarter note/rest</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Multiple measure rest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beamed eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Rubank</em></td>
<td>Quarter note/rest</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note/rest</td>
<td>Common time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whole note/rest</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eighth note</td>
<td>6/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted quarter note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sixteenth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted eighth, sixteenth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Triplet</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1b

Rhythmic Concepts Included in Comprehensive Band Method Books

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Book</th>
<th>Notes &amp; Rests</th>
<th>Time Signatures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Essential Elements</em></td>
<td>Quarter note/rest</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note/rest</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whole note/rest</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eighth note</td>
<td>Common time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Multiple measure rest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted-quarter and eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eighth note and dotted quarter note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single eighth note/rest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Measures of Success</em></td>
<td>Quarter note/rest</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note/rest</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whole note/rest</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td>Common time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beamed eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted quarter note and eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eighth note and dotted quarter note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eighth rest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sound Innovations</em></td>
<td>Quarter note</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whole note</td>
<td>Common time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note/rest</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quarter rest</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beamed eighth notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single eighth note/rest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted quarter note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Multiple measure rest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Tradition of Excellence</em></td>
<td>Whole note/rest</td>
<td>4/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half note/rest</td>
<td>Common time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quarter note/rest</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single eighth note/rest</td>
<td>3/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beamed eighth note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted half note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dotted quarter note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Number of Rhythmic Concepts

The next step in the process of analyzing the rhythmic aspects of each method book was to identify how many concepts each book contained. Each number consists of the combined totals of the concepts within the rhythmic aspects; notes, rests, and time signatures. The number of rhythmic concepts that were present within each private flute and large ensemble method book are presented in Table 2.

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title of Book</th>
<th>Number of Concepts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tradition of Excellence</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluting Stars*</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beginner’s Book for Flute*</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures of Success</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flute 101: Mastering the Basics*</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sound Innovations</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential Elements</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubank Elementary Method*</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Sequencing of Concepts

Another aspect that affected rhythm instruction within each of the method books was the sequencing of concepts throughout the book. Tables 3a and 3b show a representation of the page numbers that the introduction for each concept occurred in the comprehensive band methods and private flute methods.
Table 3a

Sequencing of Concepts in Solo Flute Method Books

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Beginner’s Book for Flute</th>
<th>Flute 101: Mastering the Basics</th>
<th>Fluting Stars</th>
<th>Rubank Elementary Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Whole note</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half note</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarter note</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beamed eighths</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single eighth</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td>77</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dotted half</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17/28</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dotted quarter</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dotted quarter, eighth</td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixteenth</td>
<td></td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dotted eighth, sixteenth</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Triplet eighths</td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whole rest</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half rest</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarter rest</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eighth rest</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple measure rest</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4/4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common time</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3/4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/2 (cut time)</td>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4/2</td>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/8</td>
<td></td>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3b

Sequencing of Concepts in Comprehensive Band Methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Essential Elements</th>
<th>Measures of Success</th>
<th>Sound Innovations</th>
<th>Tradition of Excellence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long tone</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whole note</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3b
Cont.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Essential Elements</th>
<th>Measures of Success</th>
<th>Sound Innovations</th>
<th>Tradition of Excellence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Half note</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarter note</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4/8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beamed eighths</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single eighth</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dotted half</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dotted quarter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dotted quarter, eighth</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eighth, dotted quarter</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whole rest</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half rest</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarter rest</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eighth rest</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple measure rest</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4/4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common time</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3/4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Graphic Layout**

Throughout each book, the techniques used for presenting new information contained characteristics specific to graphic layout and presentation style. The graphic representations for introducing rhythmic concepts spanning across both private flute and large ensemble method books implemented the use of a picture, a written definition of the term(s), and the numerical counts associated with that figure. The numerical counts were primarily associated with explanations of notes and rests. These counts depicted the duration of each concept in relation to a simple meter time signature, such as 4/4, 3/4, or 2/4. For example, if a book used counts to support the explanation of a half note, “1-2” or
“1&2&” may appear in the proximity of the information associated with this notational figure. Additional information associated with rhythmic instruction included exercises designed to focus solely on rhythmic skill development. The specific techniques used for the graphic layout of the rhythmic concepts in private flute and large ensemble method books are included in Tables 4a and 4b.

Table 4a
Concept Introductions in Solo Flute Methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Picture</th>
<th>Written Definition</th>
<th>Numerical Counts</th>
<th>Additional Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beginner’s Book for Flute</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flute 101</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluting Stars</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubank</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4b
Concept Introductions in Comprehensive Band Methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Picture</th>
<th>Written Definition</th>
<th>Numerical Counts</th>
<th>Additional Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Essential Elements</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures of Success</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sound Innovations</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradition of Excellence</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER V
DISCUSSION

The method books used for private flute and large ensemble instruction contained distinct organizational formats and conceptual information. When analyzing these characteristics in association with rhythmic elements, there was not a universal method for rhythm instruction across all method books. The analysis of the organizational styles, introduction of concepts, specific concepts included, and the sequencing of each of the method books all provided evidence that both similarities and differences in rhythm instruction existed.

Comparative Analysis of Rhythms Included

In the comparative analysis of the number of rhythmic concepts an additional difference between each book was evident. The maximum number of individual concepts seen in the method books was nineteen, while the minimum number was fourteen. Although these two totals were not extremely disparate from the remainder of the data, the frequency in the number of concepts contained little consistency across the two types of method books.

One factor contributing to the inconsistencies noted between the number of concepts was related to the presentation of specific rhythmic concepts. For example, both Fluting Stars\(^{39}\) and Beginner’s Book for Flute\(^{40}\) introduced the eighth note in both the

\(^{39}\) Pucihar and Pucihar, Fluting Stars Book 1, 77.
single form as well as beamed form. Additional eighth note material regarding playing eighth notes both beamed together and separately was also presented in *Sound Innovations*.41 Another rhythmic pattern appeared in both *Measures of Success*42 and *Essential Elements*.43 These books included both the dotted quarter note followed by eighth note pattern, and an eighth note followed by a dotted quarter note as separate concepts. Furthermore, *Rubank Elementary Method*44 and *Flute 101: Mastering the Basics*45 included advanced rhythms, such as; sixteenth notes, the dotted eighth sixteenth note, and triplet eighths.

Variation in the number of concepts was also associated with the introduction of time signatures. All of the method books included the time signatures 4/4, 3/4, and 2/4. In addition, all of the methods included instruction related to common time, excluding *Fluting Stars*. Moreover, additional time signatures were introduced within three of the solo flute method books. *Flute 101: Mastering the Basics*46 and *Rubank Elementary Method* included 6/8 time,47 while *Beginner’s Book for Flute* included both 2/248 and 4/2.49

41 Sheldon et al., *Sound Innovations for Concert Band*, 24.
42 Sheldon et al., *Measures of Success*, 29.
43 Lautzenheiser et al., 22.
44 Petersen, *Rubank Elementary Method*.
45 Louke and George, *Flute 101*.
46 Louke and George, *Flute 101*, 33.
Comparative Analysis of the Sequencing of Rhythmic Concepts

Similarity between the two types of method books appeared only in the analysis of the sequencing of the concepts. Based upon the data, it was concluded that numerous concepts were introduced at the beginning of each book. Multiple concepts occurred simultaneously at the beginning of the book to guide the student through music reading so that further progress in the book could be made. As the methods continued, the concepts became slightly more dispersed and occurred either one per page or a few pages apart. Sequencing of the concepts in the books portrayed a parallel understanding of an effective pacing of concepts between the methods for band instruction and private flute methods.

Comparative Analysis of Graphic Layout and Organization

The information gathered through the analysis of the graphic layout proved dissimilarity was evident between the explanations of rhythmic concepts. Throughout each of the methods, the format of the explanations was tailored to the style of each individual book. The most detailed graphic layouts associated with concept introductions were seen in Beginner’s Book for Flute and Flute 101: Mastering the Basics. These books used a picture, a written definition, and provided numerical counts associated with the notational symbol being explained. In contrast, Fluting Stars provided explanations for concepts through a picture of the symbol and a written definition. The graphic layout noted in Rubank Elementary Method further simplified concept introductions by only

48 Wye, Beginner’s Book for the Flute, 53.
49 Wye, Beginner’s Book for the Flute, 53.
providing the student with a picture of the notational symbol and the numerical counts associated with the figure.

Overall, the techniques used for introducing concepts throughout the comprehensive band methods proved to contain more similarity and detail than the private flute methods. Each of the comprehensive methods chose to introduce concepts using a pictorial representation, a written definition of the term, and numerical counts associated with the concept. Additionally, the end of each book contained exercises related strictly to reinforcement of rhythmic concepts.

Organizational differences were also apparent in highlighting the occurrence of introductory material between the two types of books. Each solo flute method book chose to highlight introductory material characteristic to the style of the book. The introductions in Fluting Stars occurred in the front of the individual sections of the book. These introduction pages contained all of the new concepts throughout the chapter rather than directly before the melodic exercises containing the new material. New material in Beginner’s Book for the Flute was dispersed throughout the method directly before the exercises that would contain that new concept. Introductions did not consistently appear in any specific location throughout the text but were distributed in relation to the exercises that surrounded the instructional material. Throughout Rubank Elementary Method, the new concepts appeared at the top of the page for which associated exercises

50 Pucihar and Pucihar, Fluting Stars Book.

51 Wye, Beginner’s Book for the Flute.
were located. The concepts were displayed along a single music staff in notational form, as seen in Figure 1.52

![Quarter Notes-Quarter Rests](image)

Figure 1. Rubank Elementary Method Graphic.53 Rubank Elementary Method for Flute or Piccolo by A. C. Petersen. © 1934 by Rubank, Inc. International. Copyright Secured. All Rights Reserved. Reprinted by permission of Hal Leonard LLC.

The last private method book analyzed, Flute 101: Mastering the Basics, displayed each concept in individual small boxes, as seen below in Figure 2, at the top of the page where related melodic exercises occur.54

When analyzing the comprehensive band method books, the presentation of new conceptual information appeared in a similar manner. Essential Elements,55 Measures of Success,56 and Sound Innovations57 all placed information inside boxes that appeared to be either highlighted or shaded in color, as seen in Figures 3 and 4.

---

52 Peterson, Rubank Elementary Method.
53 Peterson, Rubank Elementary Method, 4.
54 Louke and George, Flute 101.
55 Lautzenheiser et al.
56 Sheldon et al., Measures of Success.
57 Sheldon et al., Sound Innovations.
floor when doing these exercises.

**Time Signature:** At the beginning of a line, there is a time signature such as $\frac{4}{4}$. The top number indicates the number of beats per measure (4). The lower number indicates a basic note value (4 = quarter note).

**NOTE VALUES:**

- $\frac{4}{4}$ = quarter note = 1 beat (25 cents)
- $\frac{2}{4}$ = half note = 2 beats (50 cents)
- $\frac{1}{4}$ = whole note = 4 beats ($1.00$)

Figure 2. *Flute 101: Mastering the Basics* Graphic.\(^{58}\) © 2010 by Theodore Presser Company International. Copyright Secured. All Rights Reserved. Included by permission of Carl Fischer, LLC.

![Quarter Notes and Rests](image)

Figure 3. *Sound Innovations* Graphic.\(^{59}\)

---

\(^{58}\) Louke and George, *Flute 101*.

\(^{59}\) Sheldon et al., *Sound Innovations*, 8.
Similarly, *Tradition of Excellence* placed information in colored boxes, however, each was specifically color-coded according to the category corresponding to the information inside. As seen in Figure 5, blue boxes were used to highlight rhythmic concepts throughout the book.  

---

60 Lautzenheiser et al., 7.  
61 Pearson and Nowlin, *Tradition of Excellence*.  
Overall, the comprehensive band methods provided a visually appealing and streamlined approach to the organizational structure of highlighting new material introductions. The placement of the boxes throughout the books on individual pages was not identical, however the organizational structure remained the same. *Tradition of Excellence* placed the introductions at the top of each page,63 while *Essential Elements, Measures of Success*, and *Sound Innovations* displayed the information directly above the melodic exercise that implemented the new concepts. By highlighting material in this manner, the comprehensive band methods provided an organizational format that was easy to follow and reference.

CHAPTER VI
CONCLUSIONS AND ASSESSMENT

Conclusions

Currently, numerous method books have been written for use in classroom and private lesson settings. These method books are typically written with a specific audience in mind, and do not necessarily take into account other (private) instruction that the student may be receiving. The analysis of rhythmic instruction in method books for classroom instruction and beginning flute private instruction show both similarities and differences present in the organization of information and concepts included in method books.

The inconsistencies between the methods impact the instructional content in each book. In general, the band method books provide a greater variety of techniques for explaining each of the rhythmic concepts, which supports a diverse range of classroom activity. The instructional techniques in the private flute methods are individualized to the style of each book, which warrants differences in both content and instructional material. Overall, the instruction in the private flute methods provides a level of rhythmic instruction, which assumes the teacher will provide further explanation and reinforcement of rhythmic concepts. Instructional materials throughout the methods for solo flute provide the student with less information regarding each concept and do not diligently reinforce concepts through rhythm specific exercises.
The comparative data highlights the absence of a universal method for teaching rhythm within method books for large ensemble and private flute instructional settings. The information facilitating rhythmic concepts proves to be uniquely designed for the layout and style of each individual book. Although the information gathered in this study is unable to account for the instructional role of the teacher, it does have the ability to influence the potential for instructional consistency of rhythmic skills across the method books used in different learning environments. By gaining awareness of the differences apparent between the method books used in the classroom and private lesson settings, teachers will have the ability to better adapt rhythmic instruction and more effectively influence student understanding.

**Assessment**

Method books have the potential to supplement instruction and provide an appropriate content outline for a teacher. No matter the environment, the teacher typically consults a method book to guide and support instruction. It is important that the chosen method book meets the expectations of the teacher while simultaneously presenting information for acquiring necessary skills. Characteristics related to the graphic layout, organization, number of concepts, and sequencing of concepts all play a significant role in the effectiveness of method book content. The analyses of these characteristics lead to a personal assessment regarding the efficacy of rhythmic instruction within each method book.

Throughout the methods for band instruction, the graphic layouts provide numerous techniques for explaining concepts. In my opinion, a graphic layout containing
various methods for explaining each concept is most effective. Providing the student with multiple ways of viewing a specific concept can increase the likelihood of student retention and comprehension. Instructional variety is important due to the inconsistencies in student perception of new material. Another factor pertaining to the effectiveness of a method book is the organizational structure of the graphic layout. The clearest form of organization is consistently in the comprehensive band methods. These methods show new material within colored or highlighted boxes. This delivers the concepts in a visually appealing manner, and makes material identifiable. These boxes also allow the student to easily reference previously learned concepts. When new material is not easily identifiable in the book, difficulty in quickly finding both previous and current explanations of concepts is likely.

The number of concepts also impacts the effectiveness of rhythmic learning. If a book includes too many concepts, the student may feel overwhelmed or unable to comprehend information. On the other hand, by presenting too few concepts, the student may become uninterested or unable to properly execute concepts encountered in repertoire. Additionally, some of the material can become unused due to student and teacher’s desire for progress. Both types of methods present a reasonable number of concepts in association with the length of the book.

One discrepancy the books include is evident in the specific concepts. Some of the concepts seen throughout the methods may not be suitable for the beginner’s rhythmic vocabulary. Particularly in the solo flute methods, the inclusion of more advanced rhythms such as triplet eighths, sixteenth notes, or variations on these figures is
recorded. I believe these concepts are unnecessary for the beginning method book.

Successfully grasping simpler rhythms and meters assists the student in learning more complicated concepts as they progress.

Another characteristic present in a number of the methods is the introduction of specific rhythmic values in various forms. For example, the eighth note is shown in both single and beamed form. I believe that the presentation of these concepts as separate entities in the book nurtures the understanding of each figure’s rhythmic significance. As long as similar figures are presented in near proximity, a connection can be gained between those two figures. The student also gains the opportunity to understand the concepts on a separate basis as well as in conjunction with one another.

In my opinion, each method book presents an appropriate approach to the sequencing and pacing of concepts. When implementing instruction through a method book, one must acquire a basic understanding of reading musical notation before progressing through the material. Each book presents a basis for music reading before progressing to melodic exercises. The student is introduced to foundational notational figures, propelling learning early in the book. Initial stages of music reading present the student with a number of additional factors contributing to difficulty in beginning instrumental learning which include: tone production, posture, and proper fingerings. If a student is overwhelmed by numerous, simultaneous rhythmic concepts, the potential for limited success and comprehension is probable.

The graphic layout, number, type, and sequencing of concepts all play a substantial role in the effectiveness of a method book. A graphic layout that presents the
student with a number of different explanations related to each concept likely creates a
decker and more lasting understanding. Providing the student with an organizational
structure that visually aids the recognition of concept introductions and explanations
forms an easily identifiable reference tool for both the student and the teacher. In
conjunction with these other characteristics, a balanced number and sequencing of
concepts fosters consistently paces instruction. More importantly, a method book merely
has the ability to assist in supplementing teacher-guided instruction.

Implications for Teachers

Often, a dichotomy is evident between instrumental instruction in private and
large ensemble settings. An analysis comparing rhythmic instruction within method
books for comprehensive band and solo flute provides teachers with a heightened
awareness of the techniques used across different educational settings. This leads to a
better understanding of the complete instruction a student receives in both environments.
Gaining this knowledge allows both private and large ensemble instructors to reference
outside methods as an additional source of supplementary material. Ultimately, this
information assists teachers in the implementation of complimentary instructional
techniques.

Implications for Further Research

A number of the characteristics within method books for private flute instruction
and large ensemble instruction can be analyzed for future comparative studies. Beginning
method books include instructional information regarding proper hand position and
posture, tone production, fingering notes on the instrument, and other music terminology.
Each of these aspects can be analyzed regarding the overall effectiveness of the book’s ability to provide instruction to the beginning student.

Although this study focuses on method books used for flute, this type of analysis can also be used with method books for other instruments that have numerous books written for use in the private lesson and large ensemble settings. Further research comparing method books used within private and large ensemble instruction can provide information regarding similarities and differences between the two types of instructional methods, and help teachers understand how to further accommodate more consistent instructional techniques in both settings.
REFERENCES


Habegger, Laura. “Number Concept and Rhythmic Response in Early Childhood.” *Music Education Research* 12, no. 3 (September 2010): 269-80.


APPENDIX A

PERMISSIONS TO REPRODUCE ILLUSTRATIONS

From: Alfred Permissions <permissions@alfred.com>
Date: Mar 7, 2017 at 12:35 PM
To: music.mandym@gmail.com <music.mandym@gmail.com>
Subject: RE: use of picture in dissertation

Hello Mandy,

Thank you for your request.

I am happy to inform you that as this is for in-classroom usage it would be deemed EDUCATIONAL in nature and therefore fall under FAIR USE. You are clear to proceed forward.

Thank you for respecting the rights of our artists and we wish you the best with your dissertation.

Sincerely,

Michael Worden
Copyright Resource and Contract Administrator
Alfred Music

From: Mandy Mitchell [mailto:music.mandym@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, March 05, 2017 6:10 AM
To: Sound Innovations <soundinnovations@alfred.com>
Subject: use of picture in dissertation

Hello,

I am currently in the process of completing my dissertation document focused on the organizational layout of rhythm instruction in method books. I am interested in using the picture I have attached to this email within my document, and would like to request your permission to do so.

Please notify me as soon as possible as to whether or not this would be appropriate.
Dear Mandy,

We are happy to grant you permission to reproduce the picture attached in your dissertation. We only ask that you include the following copyright notice below the illustration:

© Neil A. Kjos Music Company  
Reproduced with permission 2017

Wishing you continued success.

With kind regards,

Mark Kjos  
NEIL A. KJOS MUSIC COMPANY

Hello,

I am currently in the process of completing my dissertation document focused on the organizational layout of rhythm instruction in method books. I am interested in using the picture I have attached to this email within my document, and would like to request your permission to do so.

Please notify me as soon as possible as to whether or not this would be appropriate.

Thank you,

Mandy Mitchell
## Schedule A:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Page of Image</th>
<th>Image</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Essential Elements For Band Flute Book 1</td>
<td>Page 7</td>
<td>Introducing Whole Rest and Half Rest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubank Elementary Method For Flute Or Piccolo</td>
<td>Page 4</td>
<td>Quarter Note – Quarter Rests</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

VIA EMAIL: music.mandym@gmail.com

March 16, 2017
Mandy Mitchell
310- C Ashland Dr.
Greensboro NC 27403

RE: Essential Elements For Band Flute Book I
By Tim Lautzenheiser, John Higgins, Charles Menghini, Paul Lavender, Tom C. Rhodes and Don Bierschenk
Copyright (c) 2004 by HAL LEONARD CORPORATION
International Copyright Secured All Rights Reserved
Reprinted by Permission of Hal Leonard LLC

Rubank Elementary Method For Flute Or Piccolo
By A.C. Petersen
Copyright (c) 1934 by Rubank, Inc.
International Copyright Secured All Rights Reserved
Reprinted by Permission of Hal Leonard LLC

Dear Ms. Mitchell:

We hereby grant you permission to include the images as specified on the attached Schedule A of the above-cited publications in your dissertation entitled Teaching Rhythm: A Comparative Study of Beginning Band and Solo Flute Method Books. Credit will be given directly under the image to be included as listed above. This permission is limited to use of the above-cited publications for purposes of your dissertation and does not include any right to use the publications, or any part thereof, in any other publications, or for any commercial purposes.

Our fee for this usage is U.S.$15.00 per publication, for a total fee of $30.00.

If the terms of this agreement are acceptable, please return a countersigned copy of this letter to us with your payment via check in U.S. funds drawn on a U.S. bank. This agreement shall not be deemed effective nor shall the license rights be deemed granted hereunder unless we receive a countersigned copy of this letter along with the fee cited above.

Sincerely,

[Signature]
Michelle Pehler
Licensing Administrator
Business Affairs

Agreed to:

[Signature]
Mandy Mitchell
March 17, 2017

Ms. Mandy Mitchell
310-C Ashland Dr.
Greensboro NC 27403
Re: Dissertation Permission

Dear Mandy:

Carl Fischer, LLC, on behalf of the Theodore Presser Company (the “Owner”), hereby grants to you (the “Licensee”) non-exclusive permission to include portions of the copyrighted publication entitled *Flute 101: Mastering the Basics* by Phyllis Avidan Louke and Patricia George (the “Work”) in your dissertation (the “Dissertation”) to the University of North Carolina Greensboro (“UNCG”) and ProQuest. The Dissertation is to be published by UNCG and ProQuest in any format per the following terms:

Term: Five (5) years
Media: Distribution through UNCG and ProQuest only
Fee: Twenty-Five Dollars ($25.00)

*Note:* This permission is for a term of five (5) years only and expires on March 17, 2022. In the event that you wish to renew this license upon expiration, please request the necessary permission at the time and your request will be reviewed accordingly.

The copyright notice, as it appears in the Work, shall appear in the Dissertation along with an indication that it was included with permission.

Please sign and return one copy of this agreement.

Carl Fischer, LLC
a/b/o Theodore Presser Company

Mandy Mitchell

Jay J. Berger
Manager, Licensing & Copyright

JLB:tp

48 Wall Street 28th floor, New York, NY 10005
P (212) 777-0900 • F (212) 477-6996 • www.carlfischer.com