JONES, JOSEPH BENJAMIN. D.M.A. Understanding Conductor-Educator Identity Formation in Novice Band Music Educators: A Case Study. (2021)
Directed by Dr. Kevin M. Geraldi. 92 pp.

This study explored the intersection of conducting and music teaching through the lens of music teacher identity in novice band music educators via a multicase study design that focused on the lived experiences of four novice band music educators. The following questions were addressed in the study:

1. How do novice band music educators describe their teacher identity?

2. What factors influence the formation of this identity?

3. How do these teachers view and understand the role of conducting in their pedagogy?

Results indicated the formation of the participants' music teacher identity was influenced by a variety of factors including their previous experiences as well as their understanding of and reflection on these experiences. From the data, it was difficult to ascertain if the participants saw their music teacher identities as a merger of educator and conductor, as they did not view themselves as conductors. Results also indicated a lack of influence from conducting course instructors for the participants. This research serves to aid conducting and music education instructors in the pursuit of advancing the teaching of conducting.

UNDERSTANDING CONDUCTOR-EDUCATOR IDENTIFY FORMATION

IN NOVICE BAND MUSIC EDUCATORS: A CASE STUDY

by

Joseph Benjamin Jones

A Dissertation

Submitted to

the Faculty of The Graduate School at

The University of North Carolina at Greensboro

in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree

Doctor of Musical Arts

Greensboro

2021

Approved by

_____
Dr. Kevin M. Geraldi
Committee Chair

DEDICATION

To my aunt, Mary Frances J. Lewis, and my parents, Richard A. Jones and Pepie H. Jones, this is dedicated to you.

APPROVAL PAGE

This dissertation written by Joseph Benjamin Jones has been approved by the following committee of the Faculty of The Graduate School at The University of North Carolina at Greensboro.

Committee Chair

_____
Dr. Kevin M. Geraldi

Committee Members

_____
Dr. Jonathan P. Caldwell

_____
Dr. Tami J. Draves

_____
Dr. Jennifer S. Walter

October 4, 2021

Date of Acceptance by Committee

October 4, 2021

Date of Final Oral Examination

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I: DESCRIPTION OF STUDY

Music teacher identity construction is an important topic in music research. More than 15 studies have been completed related to music teacher identity and socialization. This suggests that the exploration of how music teacher identities are formed is critical to the future of music teaching. That is, if the formation of music teacher identities can be determined, the profession of music teacher education may be able to use this information to recruit and retain more and better teachers. Exploring the intersection of music teacher identity and conducting identity in novice band music educators may aid the profession in disentangling how professional roles are assumed.

Little research has been done to understand specifically whether the role of conductor has been integrated into music teacher identity. Inspiration for this study was taken in part from a doctoral dissertation written by Sommer Forrester (2017). Forrester examined the intersection of instrumental music teaching and conducting through the theoretical framework of pedagogical content knowledge (PCK). Forrester followed four experienced instrumental music educators over a period of several months via interviews, observations, stimulated recall sessions, and a focus group conversation. The study concluded that the "intersection" of instrumental music pedagogy and conducting was actually a merger of the knowledge gained from multiple roles for the four participants. Findings from the study presented an opportunity to observe music teachers, their experiences, and the multiple roles they occupy in the classroom. Forrester suggested further research could be undertaken to examine the perceptions and experiences of teachers across all areas of music education and suggested identity as a possible lens to further examine the merger of conductor identity and music teacher identity.

Novice band music educators experience difficulty describing their music teacher identities for a number of reasons. The variety of roles and responsibilities educators undertake may lead to complications when attempting to conceptualize and discuss their music teacher identities. Authors in extant research (Berg, 2014; Haston & Russell, 2012; Isbell, 2014; Natale-Abramo, 2015; Pellegrino, 2009; Scheib, 2003) have described the struggles of educators with defining their music teacher identity and how it developed. Exploring the experiences of novice band music educators may allow researchers to find new ways of helping preservice and inservice teachers prepare for and acclimate to their roles in the classroom.

Using the lenses of identity construction and socialization, this study explored the possible formation of a conductor–educator role identity in novice band music educators. Specific research questions included:

1. How do novice band music educators describe their teacher identity?

2. What factors influence the formation of this identity?

3. How do these teachers view and understand the role of conducting in their pedagogy?

By exploring the data collected through interviews with four participants, several themes emerged, offering a more detailed view of the intersection of music teaching and conducting. The experiences of novice band music educators are presented in relation to their music teacher identity and use of conducting. From the study, it may be possible to suggest approaches for improving conducting courses and to develop strategies aimed towards helping music education students and novice music educators better understand their music teacher identity as it intersects with their conducting identity.

CHAPTER II: REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Identity and socialization are complex topics that have long been of interest to scholars in a variety of fields. Specifically, music teacher identity construction is a consistent area of research in music education. In the following review of related literature, the discussion will center around identity construction and socialization, occupational socialization, role stress, and role mergers. These topics were selected to introduce the concept of role mergers in relation to music educators and to advance the research of identity construction through the inclusion of the conductor identity.

Defining Music Teacher Identity and Socialization

Identity

Identity consists of multiple, sometimes conflicting, levels of socialization that change with time. Researchers believe identity is a constantly changing process that is negotiated moment-to-moment (Beijaard, Verloop, & Vermunt, 1999; Bernard, 2005). This process accounts for constant shifts of context and positions on multiple levels, which include age, gender, class, race, ethnicity, and status (Bernard, 2005). Woodford (2002) described identity as the knowledge of oneself and others, which leads to an understanding of appropriate behavior in social roles and contexts. Beijaard, Verloop, and Vermunt (1999) added that identity includes not only how individuals see themselves but also how they are seen by others. Social constructivists have argued that identity is primarily formed through social means (Austin, Isbell & Russell, 2010; Bouij, 1998; Isbell, 2008; Natale-Abramo, 2015; Woodford, 2002), although Bernard (2005) believed this included the combination of individual, social, and cultural interactions. Researchers have discussed music teacher identity at length, but less has been written concerning how conducting intersects with music teaching as part of a teacher's perceived identity.

Understanding music teacher identity requires further investigation of socialization—the process by which individuals acquire the skills, values, beliefs, and resources required to participate in society (Austin, Isbell, & Russell, 2010; Berg, 2014; Isbell, 2014; Woodford, 2002).

Socialization

Socialization is a lifelong process that influences identity construction (Haston & Russell, 2012) and can be segmented into several separate periods, generally beginning when children enter school. Primary socialization includes the time from preschool through high school (Austin, Isbell, & Russell, 2010; Haston & Russell, 2012; Woodford, 2002), and secondary socialization occurs when individuals enter the workforce or enroll in higher education (Austin, Isbell, & Russell, 2010; Berg, 2014; Haston & Russell, 2012; Isbell, 2008; Woodford, 2002). Woodford (2002) and Isbell (2008) agree that most of the development of music teacher identity occurs during an individual's primary socialization.

Isbell (2008) also found that secondary socialization could influence identity construction more than previously thought. In fact, Austin, Isbell, and Russell (2010) believed that the secondary socialization of music students may be driven by the performance culture of a music school. They also found that the socialization process in music schools was not limited to one factor but was instead a combination of multiple influences, including studio teachers, ensemble directors, music education professors, and experiences such as performance activities and teaching opportunities. The authors stated 48% (N = 454) of music majors in their study identified the studio teacher as their strongest musician role model as well as their strongest teacher role model. In terms of teacher role models, ensemble conductors accounted for 13%, former high school teachers were 12%, and music education faculty were 11% (Austin, Isbell, & Russell, 2010).

Based on extant research, the cause-and-effect relationship between identity and socialization has been apparent and important to understanding the development of music teachers. The understanding of music teacher identity is made possible and given meaning through the examination of the context that leads to that point of realization. The experiences of novice teachers form the lens through which they view themselves as people and, consequently, lead to the construction of their music teacher identity. The stages of socialization that carry music teachers through their early experiences in music education inevitably lead them to explore how they fit into the profession and inform how they will behave in their careers.

Occupational Socialization and Identity

An additional component of the socialization process is occupational socialization. As the process through which a person learns the attitudes and behaviors needed to function in their profession (Austin, Isbell, & Russell 2010; Marshall, 1994), occupational socialization grows from an individual's relationship to their job title (Johnson, 2014). Austin, Isbell, and Russell (2010) believed individuals begin to develop occupational identity during the period of secondary socialization (i.e., as people go to college or enter the workforce). Berg (2014), however, stated that occupational socialization may begin for some music educators in high school based on their early experiences with teaching and mentoring. Using these studies as a framework, we may be able to better understand the process of occupational socialization and identity construction for novice band music educators and the inclusion of the conductor identity.

A teacher's identity has been influenced by the interaction of multiple characteristics, including contexts, experience, and the teacher's biography (Beijaard, Verloop, & Vermunt, 1999) that includes time spent in college obtaining a bachelor's degree. Developing a deeper understanding of occupational identity construction may help college and university music

schools better focus the curriculum (Haston & Russell, 2012). Isbell (2014) stated, "If music teacher educators wish to improve their preparation programs, the process by which preservice music teachers acquire the norms and understandings of the music teaching profession, occupational socialization, needs to be closely examined" (p. 2). The occupational socialization of music education students is somewhat dependent on their chosen degree type and the balance of curricular requirements at individual institutions. For example, Austin, Isbell, and Russell (2010) found participants pursuing music education degrees from schools with more emphasis on performance had weaker occupational identities as teachers (2010).

The various aspects of occupational socialization offer a means to examine the totality of the music education student experience, including that of conductor identity construction. Exploring conductor training in music education degree programs as part of the occupational socialization process is a crucial step to determine how novice music educators view themselves in relation to the roles they occupy in the classroom. Additional information about how music education students learn and develop into teachers may be found through exploring music teacher roles and role stress.

Teacher Roles and Conflicts

Performer and Educator Continuum

Several researchers associated with music teacher identity construction have examined the two prominent roles of performer and educator as part of a nonbinary continuum, and they have suggested these as the two main components of music teacher identity (Bernard, 2004; Isbell, 2008; Johnson, 2014; Natale-Abramo, 2015; Pellegrino, 2009; Woodford, 2002). Others have added that conflicts between these two components (performer and educator) may be influenced by how music education students are socialized (Haston & Russell, 2012; Johnson,

6

2014; Pellegrino, 2009; Woodford, 2002). In addition, several recent case studies investigated the conflict, combination, or merger of the performer and educator role identities of music educators (Forrester, 2017; Johnson, 2014; Natale-Abramo, 2015). Researchers suggested that music educators experienced conflict and struggle between the identity roles of performer and educator (Haston & Russell, 2012; Johnson, 2014; Natale-Abramo, 2015). Dolloff (2007) believed that struggles with identity were issues each educator would grapple with moment to moment, and it was the music school's responsibility to help students integrate these different facets of their identity through opportunities to explore various parts of the teaching profession. Investigating the process by which novice music educators come to understand the components of performer and educator as part of occupational socialization may prove integral in helping them reconcile role conflicts.

Role Stress

A contributing factor to how novice band music educators view themselves has been found through the exploration of role stress. During their jobs, music educators function in multiple alternating roles (e.g. educator, administrator, performer, "pseudoparent," advocate), each having its own set of expectations. Scheib (2003) stated that "role stress" occurs when these expectations do not align. Isbell (2014) suggested that the decision to have a career in music happens much earlier than the choice to become a music educator. With this in mind, students come to college with a deeply rooted identity in performance and then by comparison have limited opportunity to explore their educator roles during their degrees (Isbell, 2014). This does not mean students lack a conceptual understanding of the teaching profession, as researchers have also asserted they arrive at their music education degree programs with a previously constructed idea of what teaching is based on their experiences (Berg, 2014; Haston & Russell,

2012; Isbell, 2014). In addition to this, Haston and Russell (2012) contended that the time spent observing teachers prior to entering college and beginning the music education degree does not give students an understanding of the actual thought process of the model teacher. They stated, "While music education majors think they know what it means to be a teacher, they have a limited perspective; therefore, this element of primary socialization is not a reliable or consistent source for identity development" (p. 370). If novice music educators struggle with role stress between performer and educator, the inclusion of conductor in their identity construction and the use of conducting in their teaching could require additional research.

Music education students need ample time and experiences that allow them to reconcile what they are learning with the expectations they had coming into college courses (Isbell, 2008). According to Pellegrino (2009), preservice and inservice music educators initially view themselves as performers and later as educators as they progress through their degree programs and enter the workforce. As music education students move into teaching, the performer and educator roles conflict (Natale-Abramo, 2015). Pellegrino (2009) also noted that music educators often feel conflicted in their identities but feel strengthened in their roles as they gain experience and attempt to balance the performer and teacher aspects of their jobs. Analyzed through the intersection of novice band music educator identity construction and conducting, role stress may offer a new perspective into how these educators understand conducting and its uses in their classrooms.

With these concepts in mind, music education programs have limited time to challenge, mold, and help foster the educator role in music education students and must carefully cultivate these experiences. Isbell (2008) suggested some music school cultures can support both the performer and educator role development, and other researchers have argued for facilitating a

broader view of music teacher identity in music education programs (Austin, Isbell, & Russell, 2010; Woodford, 2002). Austin, Isbell, and Russell (2010) also suggested an integration of musician, teacher, and scholar roles be cultivated in music schools, while other researchers have argued for a broader understanding of music teacher identity. Pellegrino (2009) and Natale-Abramo (2015) suggested moving away from the educator or performer binary, and they have contended that music education degree programs need new ways of examining and describing music educator identity.

Role of Conducting

Defining Conducting

Conducting is an important facet of life as a music educator, especially for those in ensemble-based settings. Authors have described and defined conducting in various ways. Demaree and Moses (1994) described conducting as the communication of musical ideas through gesture and believed conducting was (a) a physical pursuit demanding stamina, (b) an art that can be studied and critiqued, and (c) an intellectual pursuit requiring study and scholarship. Hunsberger (1992) took the position that "Conducting is an opportunity to use the vast resources of musical composition and performance for artistic creativity" (p. 1). Haithcock, Geraldi, and Doyle (2020) defined the conductor's mission as "compelling musical leadership" (p. 1) and described this type of leadership as the combination of the trained mind and body, communication with the ensemble, and real time self-analysis. They also acknowledged the roles of artist, teacher, and administrator as the components of a conductor. For the purposes of this study, conducting was defined as the physical manifestation of the conductor's specific expressive interpretation of a musical score via nonverbal dialogue with an ensemble.

Linking Conducting to Teaching

Several authors have listed the desired characteristics of a conductor as having confidence; work ethic; passion for music; inspirational leadership; musical integrity; knowledge of the score; developed ears; and training in music theory, history, and aural skills (Battisti, 2007; Green & Malko, 1997). Some conducting text authors also included teaching in their discussion of conductor characteristics. Waybright (2006) listed many of the same characteristics as mentioned before and also added, "There are no great conductors that are not great teachers. To be one and not the other is pointless and absurd" (p. 3). Demaree and Moses (1994) also correlated good conducting and good teaching by saying, "All conductors are music educators. Our most basic objective is to take the performers as they are and try to make them better" (p. 5).

Exploring Conductor Training

There has been no universally agreed upon collection of materials for the teaching of conducting courses. Textbooks have often been written by conductors for the purpose of training other conductors and include the author's philosophies, opinions, and collected best practices. Although some textbooks may include material aimed specifically towards music educator training, the primary purpose of these texts is to disseminate the author's method of conducting. Some conducting professors have also chosen to teach without a textbook, which results in a student learning the professor's personal philosophy of conducting. Regardless of the materials used, students come to conducting courses with a great deal of prior knowledge based on previous experiences. They have likely seen many conductors in their school ensembles and events (e.g., honor ensemble clinics, state festivals, summer enrichment programs), which leads to students bringing impressions, misconceptions, and even habits into their conducting courses.

Many conducting text authors have stated the amount of time given to learning conducting is insufficient. Harris (2001) acknowledged that a common feeling among the conductors interviewed in his book was a disparity between the amount of time spent in conducting classes in contrast to other aspects of their degree programs, and he argued that more time in front of ensembles was necessary for students to develop the skills needed to be successful conductors. Hunsberger (1992) stated the following:

> The improvement of college conducting classes is a matter of widespread concern, particularly since a large percentage of graduates will use their conducting skills extensively during their careers and many—perhaps most—will receive no additional formal instruction. The number of students who need to receive individual instruction and experience in a limited amount of class time seems inevitably to make accomplishments too limited. (p. xvii)

There has been a gap (historically) between the amount of time available for conducting courses and the amount of conducting one does in the role of music teacher. This undoubtedly has created issues in deciding how to best present the knowledge, cultivate the skills, and lay the foundations of good conducting ideas amongst music teacher educators.

Summary

The lenses of identity construction and socialization provide an opportunity to explore the formation of a conductor–educator role merger in novice band music educators. The closely related subjects of occupational socialization, role conflicts, and role stress for novice teachers offer further context in which the conductor-educator role merger can be viewed in order to gain a deeper understanding. Examining how conductor characteristics and responsibilities have been discussed in conducting texts further increases the need for exploration of the connection

11

between the conductor–educator role merger as a component of successful teaching. Exploring the intersection of music teacher identity and conducting through the experiences of novice music educators may help resolve some of the conflict between specific roles and lead to a more complete understanding of music teacher identity. To offer the broadened view called for by researchers, these concepts must be explored through data collected from current novice band music educators.

CHAPTER III: RESEARCH METHODS AND DESIGNS

In order to frame the subsequent exploration of the participants and data discussion of the use of a multiple case study design, an outline of the criteria through which participants were selected and an introduction of the four participants is necessary. Later portions of this chapter describe the data collection and analysis procedures and identify the trustworthiness measures used in this study. The chapter concludes with a reflective statement acknowledging the researcher's role in the study.

Design

A multiple case study design was used to gain a more detailed understanding of the intersection of music teacher identity and conducting for the four participants (Creswell & Poth, 2018; Stake, 2006). In a multiple case study design, the procedures for the study are replicated for each case, allowing the findings of the study to become more generalizable (Creswell & Poth, 2018). This design allowed themes to emerge from the data analysis procedures through an inductive investigative process with the researcher as the primary data collection instrument (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Furthermore, the decision to utilize a multiple case design was predicated on the ability to show different perspectives of the issues in the hopes of drawing otherwise inaccessible conclusions (Creswell & Poth, 2018).

Participant Selection Criteria

This study followed a two-tier sampling procedure to determine the participants (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Selection criteria included 5 or fewer years of teaching experience and a current position primarily based in the teaching of band. The initial participant pool consisted of eight novice band music educators selected through convenience sampling. Faculty members at colleges or universities across the United States were contacted for recommendations

of band music educators who fit the selection criteria. Potential participants gave their recommenders permission to share their contact information with the author before they were approached concerning the study. Following these recommendations, potential participants were screened to evaluate their interest, leading to a final participant pool of four novice band music educators. Additional criteria consisting of teaching setting, educational background, and number of years in the teaching profession were used to narrow the final pool. Boundaries for this study included the specific individuals, the timeframe of the fall 2020 semester, the context of the participants' years of teaching, the emphasis on band music educators, and the focus on music teacher identity and socialization as well as the participants' conducting experiences (Creswell & Poth, 2018).

Defining Novice Teachers

A consensus definition for novice teachers cannot be found in the extant literature. Researchers have used years of experience and typical characteristics of teachers at various points in their careers to define stages of teaching (Draves, 2012). Novice teachers are often defined as being in the years of preservice preparation and induction (Christensen et al, 1983; Draves, 2012). DeLorenzo (1992) and Draves (2012) defined these portions of a teachers' career as years 1 through 3, although Ballantyne and Packer (2004) described early-career teachers as those in the first 4 years of their career upon graduation from their preservice program. Additionally, Brand (1983) reported that teachers were not comfortable and competent in their jobs as music teachers until after the first 5 years of teaching.

Concerning the typical characteristics of novice teachers, Fuller (1969) divided the teachers' career into three stages: early, middle, and late based on the reported concerns of teachers. In the early stage, teachers were mostly concerned with themselves and dealt mainly

with survival concerns such as career success, upward mobility, class control, discipline, motivating students, assessing student work, interactions with parents, classroom control, and problems with individual students (Brand, 1983; Christensen et al, 1983; DeLorenzo, 1992; Fuller, 1969; Fuller & Brown, 1975). Early-stage teachers are also said to struggle with self-adequacy and deal with feelings of dependency or a self-perceived lack of skill as shown by their tendency to question their teacher knowledge, their desire to be liked by students and administration, and their typical concern with praise and failure (Christensen et al, 1983; Fuller & Brown, 1975). Teachers in these early years are also more likely to rely on coursework from degree programs (Brand, 1983; Fuller & Brown, 1975) and are more likely to request help from their cooperating teachers from their student teaching experience during the first year (DeLorenzo, 1992). According to DeLorenzo (1992), beginning teachers have a difficult time continuing their musical growth due to the responsibilities they face. Researchers have agreed teachers eventually settle into their roles and become less consumed by the factors discussed above (Brand, 1983; Christensen et al, 1983; DeLorenzo, 1992).

Participants

Each of the four participants will be introduced through the presentation of demographic information and a brief description of their 2020–2021 teaching setting. Because the participants live and work in slightly different environments, they have encountered a variety of work-related situations, responsibilities, and experiences that have shaped their views of themselves and their work. The variety of these factors, as well as the individual aspects of their personal influences, formal education, and time in the teaching profession, may allow the results of this study to be applicable to a wider group of educators. Every effort has been made to present this information in the participants' own words in order to provide both the proper context and the individuality of

15

each participant's thoughts. Each participant selected a pseudonym for their name, and additional

pseudonyms were used as needed to protect the identities of all involved (Creswell & Poth,

2018). The information that follows offers a wider view of identity construction in novice band

music educators in hopes of contextualizing the findings of the research study.

Leah

"Leah" is 26 years old, White, and identifies as female. She grew up in a suburban area

near the capital of a large, midwestern state. Her primary instruments are violin and trumpet,

which she began playing in fourth and fifth grade, respectively. Leah earned bachelor's degrees

in music education and Spanish from a large, public university in the northwestern United States

in 2018 and is currently pursuing a master's degree in music education, with an emphasis in

instrumental music, at a large, public university in the southern United States. The 2020–2021

academic year was Leah's 2nd year of teaching, though she had been working as a freelance

private lessons instructor since 2015.

Leah currently serves as the band and orchestra director at a Title I public middle school

in a southern United States capital city with a 99% African American student population. The

majority of the students are from low-income families, and 99% of students take part in the free

and reduced meal program. Many students enrolled in the after-school program are also provided

dinner as well. The total enrollment of the school was nearly 1,000 students for the 2020–2021

school year. The music department of Leah's school includes band, orchestra, choir, and general

music classes. Leah teaches all the instrumental music students via an A/B day calendar. Her

classes are divided by grade level and ensemble type (band or orchestra), with a total of

approximately 120 students enrolled in band and orchestra. Students are allowed to enroll in

either ensemble option by grade level, possibly resulting in seventh- or eighth-grade students

enrolled as beginners and each ensemble including a range of experience levels. Of the instrumental programs, band classes tend to be slightly larger, but each is composed of around 60 students. Almost all the band and orchestra students are provided with school-owned instruments.

Jamaal

"Jamaal" is 24 years old, African American, and identifies as male. He grew up in a rural area southeast of the capital city of a large, southeastern state. His primary instrument is the trombone, which he began playing in sixth grade. Jamaal earned bachelor's degrees in music education and mathematics from a large, public university in the southeastern United States in 2018, and the 2020–2021 academic year was his 2nd year of teaching. Jamaal currently serves as the assistant band director at a large, public high school in his hometown, where he also teaches mathematics.

The school had an enrollment of approximately 2,100 students during the 2020–2021 academic year. The racial distribution of the school is 53% White, 26% African American, 15% Latino, 2% two or more races, 2% Asian, and 2% other. Though the school is among the most affluent in the county, 26% of the student population participates in the school's free or reduced meal program. The overall city population has tripled since 2000 and includes a wide range of people from various socioeconomic backgrounds. Due to its proximity to the surrounding metropolitan areas, the city has become a suburb of the nearest large city and has seen a recent influx of diversity in its population. The music program at the school consists of band, choir, and general music classes. Of the available course offerings, Jamaal is responsible for assisting with the marching band and teaching the first-year concert band. This ensemble includes 24 of the 77

total students in the band program and often includes older students who enroll in the course to gain experience playing secondary instruments.

Kate

"Kate" is 25 years old, White, and identifies as female. She was raised in a suburban area near a large city in the southeastern United States. Her primary instrument is percussion, which she began playing in the fifth grade. Kate earned a bachelor's degree in music education from a large, public university in the midwestern United States in 2017, and the 2020–2021 academic year was her 4th year of teaching. She is currently the assistant band director at a large, public high school in the southern United States and assists at the feeder middle school programs.

The school is classified as Title I, and the student population is 52% Latino, 27% White, 18% African American, 1% two or more races, 1% Asian, <1% Pacific Islander, and <1% Indigenous Americans. A large portion of the students are considered to be from low-income families, with 64% taking part in the school's free or reduced meal program. Additionally, approximately 7% of the students are said to be learning English as part of the school district's English as a second language (ESL) program. The current student population was nearly 2,300 students for the 2020–2021 school year. The music department at Kate's school consists of band, choir, orchestra, and general music classes. The band program offers marching band, color guard, and three year-round curricular concert band ensembles: the Wind Symphony, taught by the lead director; the Symphonic Band, taught by Kate; and a team-taught Concert Band. Kate also teaches a percussion class at the high school, as well as additional percussion classes and lessons at the feeder schools.

Bryant

"Bryant" is 27 years old, White, and identifies as male. He grew up in a rural area in the southeastern United States. His primary instrument is the trumpet, which he began playing in the fifth grade. Bryant earned a bachelor's degree in music education from a small, private university approximately 45 miles away from a large city in a southeastern state in 2015, and the 2020–2021 academic year was his 5th year of teaching. Bryant teaches in a small suburban city located about 45 minutes to the south of a large metropolitan city in the southeastern United States where he is currently the assistant band director for a public city school system. In this capacity he serves with one additional band director, splitting time between three schools: intermediate, middle, and high school.

The high school had an approximate student population of 1,220 for the 2020–2021 academic year with a racial distribution of 69% White, 20% African American, 6% two or more races, 3% Latino, 2% Asian, and <1% Indigenous American. Additionally, approximately 46% of the student population participates in the school's free or reduced meal program. The middle school where Bryant teaches had an approximate student population of 650 for the 2020–2021 academic year with a racial distribution of 69% White, 19% African American, 6% two or more races, 3% Latino, and 2% Asian. Around 54% of the student population participates in the school's free or reduced meal program. The intermediate school where Bryant teaches had an approximate student population of 650 for the 2020–2021 academic year with a racial distribution of 67% White, 20% African American, 8% two or more races, and 5% Latino. Around 59% of the student population is currently participating in the school's free or reduced meal program.

The music department at Bryant's schools offers band and choir. The high school band program consists of a noncompetitive marching band consisting of ninth through 12th-grade students and two concert ensembles: a concert band for ninth graders taught by Bryant and an advanced concert ensemble for 10th- through 12th-grade students taught by the lead director. At the middle school, students are divided into homogenized brass and woodwind classes for sixth grade and combined classes for seventh and eighth grade, respectively. Bryant shares the teaching responsibilities by grade level with his colleague. Additionally, while one is leading the other is available to teach individual and small groups of students through sectionals and lessons.

Participant Consent and Privacy

The study was approved by the Institutional Review Board of The University of North Carolina at Greensboro for research involving human participants. Participants were asked to give informed consent prior to entering the study and were given information regarding privacy. The participants received the interview questions and an interview schedule in advance. Information concerning logistics and the use of technology was shared with participants prior to each interview. All data, including interview and focus group recordings, field notes, and coding, were stored securely via a Box™ account. All data collected in this study have been kept confidential unless required to be shared by law.

Data Collection Tools

Initial data consisted of a preliminary demographic questionnaire followed by three participant interviews conforming to Seidman's three-interview series (2019). Seidman aimed to understand the meaning of participant behavior by placing it in the context of their lives and the lives of those around them (2019). In this format, questions in the first interview have participants reconstruct life experiences, the second interview delves into the details of the

participants' experiences, and the third interview asks participants to reflect upon the meaning of those experiences (Seidman, 2019). This cumulative interview structure allowed for deeper understanding of participants' experiences and led to rich descriptions in the reporting of this study's findings. Participant interviews were semistructured and centered around open-ended questions.

Data collection for this study also included a focus group conversation with all participants after one-on-one interviews were completed, which created an opportunity for them to hear each other's views, explore shared experiences, and create a rich dialogue that yielded additional data. The data collected in the initial stages of research were used to develop open-ended questions designed to fill in information gaps and to collect additional information for the focus group conversation. All interviews and the focus group conversation were conducted and recorded via Zoom.

Interview Process and Questions

The interview process was piloted in a study conducted during the spring semester of 2020. The pilot study included three semistructured interviews with a willing participant in their 2nd year of teaching high school band. The responses collected as part of the pilot interviews were not included in the present study. After the pilot study was completed, the questions were peer reviewed by two additional novice music educators. Feedback was also given by faculty members, and these steps yielded further clarification pertinent to the interview process and question construction.

Analysis and Trustworthiness Measures

Data analysis consisted of a multistep process, which included transcribing interviews and focus group sessions, memoing, coding, and categorizing data into themes (Saldaña, 2016).

Notes were collected during the interviews consisting of observations of participant mannerisms, initial thoughts of participant commentary, and a round of preliminary memoing (Creswell & Poth, 2018). To ensure trustworthiness, data were collected via a variety of means to allow confirming and disconfirming evidence to emerge. Participants reviewed their interview transcripts along with the findings of the study, offering their reactions in addition to collaborating in the reporting process. The collected data were used to create a thick description, which may allow the findings to become more generalizable and transferable to other specific situations.

Reflexive Statement

I am a White, upper-middle class, cisgender, straight, nondisabled male who grew up in the southern United States. I was born in Gastonia, North Carolina and attended the University of South Carolina, where I received an undergraduate degree in music education. I then returned to my hometown, where I taught high school band for 8 years. Following my public-school teaching experiences, I attended graduate school at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro for both Master of Music and Doctor of Musical Arts degrees in instrumental conducting, with a cognate in music education. Through these experiences I encountered significant role stress and often struggled to find an understanding of my music teacher identity, leading to an interest in this research. This case study is framed by my experiences as a public-school music educator, my time in graduate school, and my desire to better understand why and how conducting is taught as part of music degree programs in colleges and universities. As such, I view the data through these frameworks but acknowledge other views offer validity and a fuller understanding of the research.

CHAPTER IV: RESULTS

Using the lenses of identity construction and socialization, this study explored the possible formation of a conductor–educator role identity in novice band music educators. Specific research questions included:

1. How do novice band music educators describe their teacher identity?

2. What factors influence the formation of this identity?

3. How do these teachers view and understand the role of conducting in their pedagogy?

Four main themes emerged from the data, which describe the participants' current understanding of their music teacher identity, the experiences that led to that knowledge, and the intersectionality of music teacher identity and conducting. These themes are:

1. The music teacher identity of the participants was formed through a variety of influences.

2. The participants experienced role stress as part of the occupation socialization process of novice band music educators.

3. The participants had limiting definitions or views of conducting and its use in their classroom.

4. The participants had fears associated with pursuing continued study in conducting due to the lack of professional development opportunities post-graduation and negative connotations with the available options.

What follows is an outline of these themes using the participants' own words and ideas. The emergent themes are framed using the research questions as context.

Research Question 1: How do novice band music educators describe their teacher identity?

In general, a range of early influences formed the teaching identities of the participants. In this section, the interview responses will be examined to determine the participants'

perceptions of their music teacher identities and how those identities developed. The discussion will explore the notable experiences that help to create these perceptions, beginning with the participants' reflections on ideal teacher traits. Additionally, each participant's views on teaching music and their awareness of teacher roles will be explored.

Ideal Teacher Traits

There was no clear consensus among the participants concerning the ideal traits of great teachers or what constituted good teaching, music-making, or conducting. When asked about the necessary qualities or traits of a great teacher, each participant responded in specific ways. Leah believed a mixture of caring nature towards students and passion for the field was important:

I think, first and foremost, being caring and being passionate about whatever subject you teach. I think passion is infectious. I tell the students that, whatever you are excited about, whatever gets you up in the morning and puts you in a good mood, it's that passion that can infect people with positivity.

Jamaal's concept of great teaching revolved around building connections with students in ways that provided emotional support:

I think being empathetic, realistic, and reflective are extremely important for teachers. I don't think students learn well from people they don't appreciate, respect, or care for. To be empathetic towards them is very important. I also think being realistic in what's happening is necessary, too. I think music teachers have to be realistic because the public sees the exact outcome of what they do. Empathy is a great starting place, but making sure the students understand what's real and what's not is so much more beneficial later on. Also, if you can't reflect on the work that you have done, then you don't know what is

24

good or what is bad and how to get better. You have to be critical and analytical in what

you do so that everything has purpose.

In addition to these ideas, Kate had a slightly different response. Her commentary leaned more

on the importance of being patient with students:

Patience with three exclamation points. It is so rare that a kid gets it on the first try.

Adaptability. Being able to change things on the fly. You know, honestly, the stuff you

wing ends up being the best because it's what is needed in the moment. I have also been

around a lot of cold, dead-faced teachers, and I think that's not a great thing at all.

Students need love, they really do. You've got to have a warm heart.

Bryant believed the relationship between teacher and student was the most important aspect of

his teaching:

Being relational with the kids, or with the students. It is just seeing them in a relational

way that acknowledges their full dignity and their full humanity. What I have discovered

in my time doing this is that if that cornerstone is not in place, it is really hard to do

anything else because the whole project needs to be built on a foundation of trust.

The consistent concept emerging from the participants' views was that successful

teaching does not necessarily, or exclusively, revolve around the subject matter or its delivery.

The participants noted the importance of building positive relationships, being patient with

students, teaching with passion, and showing empathy. Each of the ideal traits focuses more on

the student experience than the curricular content or specific activity.

The participants' discussions about ideal teacher traits are also connected to each

participant's previous experiences. Jamaal mentioned in his individual interviews he felt his

college trombone professor, among others, taught him about life and how that relationship taught

him his primary responsibility was to do the same for his students. His views on great teaching are directly tied to this concept. Additionally, Kate spoke of her early band experience as being her "happy place" but not feeling particularly close to her teachers. In saying she believed students needed love and discussing the ideal teacher trait of having a warm heart, she demonstrated, at least in part, the reflection of previous experiences in her philosophy. Finally, Bryant spoke of his middle school experience being a "revolving door" of teachers and then about building trust through positive teacher–student relationships. From examining the description of ideal teacher traits, analysis further revealed how the early participant experiences influenced their teacher identities. The coming discussion of teacher roles and role stress will demonstrate how the reflections of past teachers and models influence the participants' understanding of their work as music educators.

Awareness of Teaching Roles

When asked to identify the various roles they occupied as music educators, the participants discussed a variety of simultaneous roles. Those roles included being a pseudoparent, advocate, business manager, life coach, and counselor. It became increasingly clear that these roles were only sometimes tied to music for the participants and that each participant's responses were connected to their perceptions of their own music teacher identity. For example, in describing his daily work as a music educator, Bryant focused again on building relationships rather than music. In his commentary he outlined his role as a pseudoparent:

> For some students all I'm basically is a pseudoparent because there's not a lot of support
> at home, and there's not space for that student to speak, be heard, express themselves, or
> be cared about. I may be a pseudoparent for some, or I may need to give others the

structure they need. Then there is this other category where they provide themselves with the structure, and I need to give them fuel for the fire.

These comments support his statements concerning his relationship-centered teaching identity. In addition to this role, Bryant also discussed his responsibility to advocate for his program and profession:

I also feel like we all have a responsibility to be advocates for the profession and to demonstrate constantly, as best as we can, how it is crucial, important, and beneficial. That's something, I know for a lot of people, takes the form of a struggle, and they have to go to bat constantly to fight these aggressive forces of entropy. Thankfully, I don't have to do much of that at my schools because there is a lot of support already there. I do feel like with every new class of kids, with every new class of parents, with every new swing through the community, I have a responsibility to demonstrate and communicate this is something that we take very seriously.

The combination of advocacy and pseudoparenting represents role stress for Bryant. As defined previously, role stress occurs when the expectations for the various roles teachers occupy in the classroom have conflicting expectations and outcomes (Scheib, 2003). This role stress occurred as part of Bryant's occupational socialization and may have originated in his early experiences. Jamaal's views expanded upon this concept as he discussed the various roles he occupies and where he feels his attention is focused:

A band director does all kind [sic] of things, but they also have more of an opportunity to affect change because of the unique nature of the job and of the relationship you acquire with students over the course of 4 years. But you also have to run a business. If you are a high school band director, you have to be able to run a business, you have to be an

27

effective leader when you have all these band boosters. So, to be a band director it is

about so much more than logistics and how well you can communicate.

Jamaal also expressed his primary role as something extramusical. He described his role in the following terms:

> I think I would see myself first as a motivator, almost like a life coach. Before I even saw
>
> myself as someone who taught someone about a subject, I would see myself as a life
>
> coach because I don't care as much about the curriculum that I'm teaching as I do the
>
> people that I'm teaching. So I would see myself as a life coach, a counselor second, and I
>
> think after that I would see myself, I guess the term professor would be appropriate.
>
> Because when I think of professors, I think of people who spit information out, so that is
>
> just someone who is conveying knowledge, conveying curriculum knowledge, maybe
>
> even regardless of curriculum.
>
> Jamaal's description of his roles as a music educator mirrors his previous statements

about the ideal traits of great teachers and also raises further questions about the role of music in

his identity. Similar to Bryant and Jamaal, Leah first described herself as a caretaker for her

students:

> I think how I would describe my identity as a music educator would be very focused
>
> around caring about the students, caring about their physical well-being, their mental
>
> well-being, as well as what they can do on the musical instruments. Because, if
>
> something is lacking, or if something is not quite right or settled or stable mentally,
>
> physically, then expecting them to do XYZ on the instruments could be very difficult. I
>
> think I'm a caring music teacher that has high expectations and is constantly striving to

give my students culturally relevant as well as real life experiences. I also see myself very much as an untrained instrument repair tech as well.

Unlike Bryant, Jamaal, and Leah, who spoke about extramusical roles in support of student development, Kate discussed her roles as a music educator in more clearly defined job concepts. In her commentary she discussed the time needed for planning, stating, "Honestly, I feel like only 5% of being a band director is actually rehearsing a band. The rest is logistics, being a counselor, fixing things, and writing emails. I guess I do a lot of prep work." Based on her commentary, it is clear Kate is experiencing role stress. She was able to delineate between musical roles and administrator roles and seemed to see the musical tasks as a more passive role for her as a teacher.

The participants' responses also revealed they viewed certain roles as more or less important and that there was confusion concerning the primary roles and responsibilities of music educators. As was noted in the participants' descriptions of great teaching, music was again not always the most prominent concern. The roles they discussed often centered around the well-being of the students in extramusical terms. Pseudoparenting, life coaching, and caretaking are all extensions of a general understanding of the educator role but do not focus on music as curricular content. If the primary role occupied by these four novice music educators is something other than musician, it would seem possible the conductor role could develop later in their careers and begin as part of music teacher identity with lesser awareness.

Summary

Music educators must occupy a variety of roles in their classrooms, and the ability to do so may grow with experience. From the data it is evident the role stress experienced by the participants has impacted their current understanding of their music teacher identity, which

involved multiple aspects of prior experience. As existing research suggests the possibility of role mergers, and the participants acknowledged the perception of their music teacher identity as a combination of roles, such a paradigm may be applicable in these cases. Further evidence to support these factors may be found through the examination of the participants' views concerning conducting and its use in their classroom (research question 3).

Research Question 2: What factors influence the formation of this (teacher) identity?

Early threads of identity construction were examined for each novice music teacher, which shaped their perceptions of themselves and of their music teacher identity. Each participant encountered slightly different circumstances that contributed to their views. Among these were the early influence and support of family members, which helped the participants develop their musicianship. The participants were also influenced later by their individual experiences in high school and college, each of which supported their eventual decision to pursue careers in music education. Finally, the early teaching experiences and mentor relationships from the beginnings of the participants' careers further influenced their understanding of their music teacher identity. Examining these stages of influence and various factors will offer a more complete view of the participants and provide the necessary context to explore the intersection of their music teaching and conducting.

Initial Encounters With Music in Childhood and Adolescence

Each of the four participants cited family influences or their childhood experiences in relation to their involvement with music. Though the individual experiences vary, a review of these factors will offer greater insight. For instance, Leah and Kate both cited their parents as early influences in their musical lives in slightly different contexts. And Leah spoke of her

30

parents allowing her the autonomy to choose the amount of musical activities for herself and her early attraction to music:

> I think I was very fortunate growing up to have a very musical and supportive family. My parents took piano lessons as children and hated it, and it was a big reason why they did not actually want my sister and I to be forced into music lessons. I think we found our path to music by ourselves, and maybe that was more rewarding because I was not forced into music. My parents like to say that they knew I would pursue music, but they wanted it to be my choice. My parents had a sneaking suspicion, and maybe deep down I did too.

Kate spoke of her mother's early band directing career and its influence on her childhood musical experiences. She also specifically mentioned classical music as part of the family's musical routine:

> My mother was actually a band director in Texas. She was one of the first women to win Honor Band, so I think she is pretty cool, but 2 or 3 years before I was born, she became a lawyer. Because of her love for band and her musical knowledge, there was always music playing everywhere, tons of classical music all the time. She even had a thing called "Breakfast Opera," where if you wanted breakfast you had to sing about it and sing what you wanted.

Jamaal spoke about popular music styles, especially bands featuring wind instruments, along with family norms as part of his early influences:

> Growing up in my family, I think we had a heavy music influence. We listened to a lot growing up, mostly 90s, 80s, or 70s R&B or funk. I heard a lot of bands with tight horn lines like Earth, Wind, and Fire, all of the time, but it was not something that I necessarily noticed until middle school.

Bryant was the only participant to explicitly mention the role his grandparents played in his early music making experiences as well as the only participant to discuss the influence of church music:

> Formal music education does not run in my family, but my mom's side of the family is from the mountains, and my great-grandparents had a bluegrass band. That sort of thread is very present in my family. My grandmother was a church pianist and organist, and I spent many hours of my childhood playing on a church organ in a basement. My grandmother and mother both played piano by ear, so I was taught piano and organ by rote from the time I was 3 years old. My parents were very good about letting me be autonomous about that sort of thing, so there was no pressure from my parents.

Several key similarities emerged through cross-case analysis. For instance, each participant was exposed to music at an early age and allowed to develop their musical preferences rather independently. Additionally, each recounted their early childhood musical moments in positive ways and seemed to connect them to later musical encounters. Though there was no consistent genre of music cited (popular music styles, classical music, and church music were each recalled), the participants counted these experiences as important to their journey. In some cases this appeared in the form of family music activity and in other cases as support of the participants' interests. When viewed in context with later experiences, each of these early memories was pivotal to how the participants viewed themselves.

In addition to the influence of family members and childhood musical activities, each of the participants discussed the ways in which beginning band classes impacted their musical journey. Leah began school music classes earlier than the remaining participants through an elementary strings program. She was also the only participant to have a musical background

which included string instrument instruction. Leah spoke of these experiences and about her

feelings of success when trying instruments for the first time as contributing factors in her desire

to continue with music in school programs:

> My school district had a pull-out fourth grade strings program, and having strings from a
>
> young age was exciting! I did not necessarily love the violin, but I knew I liked music
>
> and classical music from a young age. Just before middle school we had an instrument
>
> petting zoo where they had all the different mouthpieces lined out. I remember very
>
> specifically I wanted so badly to play the flute because my sister played the flute, but I
>
> couldn't make a sound at all. I tried the trumpet mouthpiece next, and it worked
>
> immediately. I think these opportunities from a very young age helped me in my decision
>
> to continue with music.

Kate also began her school band participation during elementary school. She specifically

spoke of ensembles and her musical experiences outside the regular school curriculum as

factors in her musical development:

> I joined the school band in fifth grade and had a fine experience there. I was always a part
>
> of all the extra organizations in elementary school and then in middle school. I started
>
> private lessons in seventh grade or eighth grade from a percussion teacher who was very
>
> talented, and then I joined the youth orchestra.

Bryant and Jamaal both began their school band classes in middle school but recall the decision

to do so in different ways. For example, though Bryant was eager to join the class, he

encountered a somewhat negative experience when choosing an instrument:

> Band in middle school was kind of a given. There was never really much of a decision to
>
> be made. It was like, there was going to be some sort of musical outlet no matter what, so

I joined a band in sixth grade, like many people do. I originally wanted to play clarinet, and then the guy that was teaching at the middle school I was at said it was a girl's instrument, so the trumpet was handed to me, involuntarily.

Jamaal's entry to band class, and his experience choosing an instrument, stood in slight contrast to the remaining participants. He spoke of his initial lack of instrument preference before joining the band in middle school:

I think I entered music in the most trombone player way possible: My mom walked up to me in sixth grade and said, "Hey, do you want to join the band?" And I said, "Sure," and I went up to my band director and she said, "What instrument do you want to play?" And I said, "I don't really know," and she said, "Well, we don't have any trombones," and I said, "Sure." And here I am.

Three of the four participants recalled specific experiences concerning their initial introductions to, and eventual choice of, instrument. These experiences, combined with others from middle and high school, may show the early development of the participants' music teacher identities.

In addition to recounting their initial encounters with band classes, each participant discussed the various ways middle school band experiences influenced their lives. Bryant had positive and negative memories to share and spoke directly concerning the passion and enthusiasm of one of his middle school teachers:

My middle school band directors were a bit of a revolving door situation with lots of turnover and substitutes; it was kind of a disaster. When I came back for seventh grade the school had finally found someone to take the job full-time, and he is still there 15 years later. When he came in it was like the hero's return; he kind of saved the program. He was a percussionist, and I remember him being a really passionate guy. He was very

on fire for music, and for teaching in general. I just remember that enthusiasm was kind of contagious.

In contrast, Leah spoke of the influence of her middle school band director in strictly positive terms, recalling specifically the powerful idea that her teacher believed in her:

I guess what kept me joining these different music ensembles stemmed from the music teachers really believing in me as a student, and the groups as a whole. So, even if, you know, there were some questionable music moments, they gave everything they could to the groups to help us succeed. I think that support was very influential to see a teacher really care about you as a student.

Kate also shared positive and influential memories of her middle school band years, but in her case the influence was less centered about the teacher and more focused on the classroom environment and social aspects:

Band class was always my happy place and was always where my friends were. As far as middle school band director, I was never really close to her. I was never in trouble, so we did not have to interact too much. She was never a super hands-on teacher, maybe because she was retiring in a year or two. I didn't have a super strong relationship with her.

Jamaal's retelling of his middle school band experiences was similar to Kate's, as it focused on the comradery between students and the social aspects of school band classes:

Middle school is really where my musical experience started to take off. My band director in middle school did not really teach us music. It was an average middle school experience, and I was there for my friends. By the time I got to high school I didn't want to quit band because I hate quitting things.

The commonality is that each participant's memories focused on things that became important to them as novice music educators. For example, Jamaal's reflections dealt with the difference between teaching the music curriculum and teaching students. In a similar way, Kate discussed the distance between teacher and student and her lack of a strong connection to her middle school band director. Additionally, Bryant's comments referred to his teacher's passion for music and his admiration for that ideal, and Leah spoke of supporting and connecting to individual students. These concepts formed the foundation of each participant's desire to become a music teacher and directly impacted how they saw themselves as music teachers later in life.

Music in High School

Three of the four participants recounted their high school years as especially impactful and spoke of specific concepts key to their identity as music educators and conductors. Jamaal again spoke of the differences between teaching curricular content and teaching students, a concept he revisited frequently:

My band director was another one of those people who never really taught me music. He taught me band, and that was my entire experience with it until later in high school. Because of this I drifted away from my classmates, and I started focusing more towards the idea of "what is music?" I found it interesting, and more than just DCI, which was the peak that everyone around saw. What is Mahler when compared to the Phantom Regiment, you know? And I started to see so much more in this other genre.

Bryant referenced this time in his musical life as one where the decision to be a music teacher had already been made.

I started taking trumpet lessons in high school around the time we got the new band director. That was kind of at the point where I was fairly certain that I was

36

going to be a band director; that is the way I was going to go. I was looking at my

director thinking, "That is definitely a thing that I would like to do," and so a

major part of me was geared towards that really early on.

Kate's high school years may have been more personally impactful than other participants based

on the role she occupied as a drum major and responsibilities during multiple band director

transitions:

During my junior and senior year there was a lot of turmoil in the music department. We

had a really horrible band director my first couple of years to the point they were

removed from the position. There was a point where he wouldn't come to class unless it

was for a Wind Symphony rehearsal, and we would have random substitute teachers. The

lower bands never played, to the point where I left one of my other classes to teach them.

After this, we had an interim director who was an amazing retired teacher and then

several additional interim directors. Finally, during my senior year, we had a new director

who is actually still there now. I was drum major through all of this and helped with the

transitions. I think that role put me in teacher mode more than any other year of being a

drum major. Just because he was asking me a lot of questions, I was kind of talking him

through school stuff, and he was walking me through things that he needed. I ended up

wanting to be a teacher for a lot of reasons, but one of those was I wanted to, hopefully,

add more good teachers to the world because of that guy we originally had.

According to two participants (Bryant and Jamaal), mentors from high school did not

complete the list of individuals who directly influenced their musicianship before college. Bryant

and Jamaal spoke directly about other mentors or private teachers who played significant roles in

their socialization and therefore had an impact on later music teacher identity construction. For

example, Bryant described experiences with his high school private lessons teacher, saying, "I had a really, really great private teacher and I learned a ton from him. He was definitely a role model for me during my junior and senior year of high school." Jamaal also described a pivotal encounter with a college music major during his high school band experience:

> I have a vivid memory of the beginnings of wanting to pursue music past high school. My freshman year, I had been playing trombone for 3 years and some change at that point, and a guy who was at a local university came down to work on the marching band staff with us, and he was also a trombone player. I told him I wanted to switch instruments because at the time, all the best players in our low brass were euphonium players. He said, "Why would you want to switch to that instrument? You have God's instrument in your hand!" I told him the trombone never sounded good to me and he responded by playing a recording of Joseph Alessi playing the *Blue Bells of Scotland*. I looked at him and I said, "What instrument is that? That sounds awesome!" He made me listen to the whole thing before he told me it was the same instrument I was holding. That was the beginning of me wanting to be so much better.

The influence of high school band, band directors, and mentors on the participants cannot be understated. Through their commentary it is obvious that this time in their music journey deeply impacted their views on music and their eventual roles as music educators.

Music in College

The influence of college professors and mentors also played a tremendous role for the participants as they constructed their music teacher identities. In particular, Bryant discussed the influence of his eventual applied trumpet teacher as part of the reason for his choice in university:

I met my eventual trumpet teacher, and he was very persuasive. He is also a fantastic

teacher, and he kind of sold me on the school. I was familiar with the school and when I

met him and it kind of drew me in. So it was the combination of the familiarity, the small

school atmosphere, and the relationship with the private teacher that kind of sparked my

school decision.

Leah also specifically spoke about the important relationship with her applied teacher during her

time in college:

I guess my interactions with the staff and the faculty there were good overall. There were

just a lot of very passionate people. My professor was near the end of his career, had a lot

of years under his belt, and was kind of set in his ways, but I clicked with him. He was

really sweet and had a very grandpa feel to him, so he was just very welcoming and

warm. Some of the younger professors were more like spitfires and would be willing to

get up in your face and argue about how pianissimo it should be. So it was kind of all

over the board there.

Jamaal described his applied teacher as a mentor but also discussed several music education

faculty members as model teachers and important influences:

If I had to pick model teachers from college, one would be from the music education

department. She was a workaholic and like an Energizer Bunny. I've never seen her off,

but, because of that attitude, she has this knack of digging until she finds the solution she

needs to help her students. Her work ethic and her demeanor have always made me feel

optimistic and had a very large impact on me. Also, my trombone professor who was a

phenomenal teacher. It took me a long time to understand how he taught because the way

that he taught was so new to me. It was not, "Hey, you do this and you do this, and then

you do the thing"; he taught you to teach yourself and would give you the tools and the instruction manual but let you figure it out. His teaching was so much more than music. He taught you how to be a productive citizen and so when I think about teaching now, I think about the curriculum as being, not necessarily secondary, but as a vessel, an avenue through which I can teach them about life.

Kate spoke generally about university faculty but also specifically concerning one additional music education faculty member:

I learned my basics and pedagogy stuff in college, but the way I do things now is also totally because of them. Everybody that I studied with in college has had a large role, especially one professor in the music education department. She is fantastic and is still someone who, like, I saw her at Midwest last year and it was like I saw her yesterday when we caught up.

Thus, the four participants saw their college years as integral to their journey in becoming musicians and music educators. Each participant recalled experiences from college that informed their teaching, helped them gain knowledge, and impacted the construction of their identities as teachers. In fact, three of the four participants (Bryant, Leah, Jamaal) emphasized the influence of their applied performance teacher. And two participants (Jamaal, Kate) identified music education faculty as influential. The conducting teachers, however, were not mentioned as influential for any of the participants when recalling their university experiences.

Teaching Mentors

Each participant discussed the importance of mentor teachers as role-model teachers, mentors, and colleagues once they entered the teaching profession. For instance, Leah described the relationship between herself and a mentor teacher assigned to her by the school district:

40

I was paired up with a mentor in the city's public schools who was a big influence on me. Thankfully, he was a percussionist and came in and kind of took me under his wing. He was a big mentor to me my first year, and now that he has moved out of the district, I could text him, but he has a family, so I don't want to bother him. I would say the other mentor, just for proximity and being in the same school, the choir teacher. She was my in-house mentor my first year and basically anything I needed, I would go to her.

In addition to this, Kate, Bryant, and Jamaal each recalled mentors from their teaching situations based on their roles in the band program. As each is functioning as part of a teaching team, these participants included their colleagues as mentor–teachers. Kate described her experience in these terms:

In the last four years I've had two different head directors that I've worked under, and I would be crazy not to call them mentors because I worked with them and everything that I do, essentially, is from both of them. Also, I would definitely include my mom as a mentor. I will call her and ask her stuff a lot. The guy that I student taught with also obviously had a lot to do with how I approach things as well.

Bryant now co-teaches with his mentor teacher from his student teaching assignment. He describes how that relationship affected him and his teaching in this way:

The first few years after student teaching kind of felt like an extension of that experience. I think he introduced me to the qualities and characteristics of great teachers and band directors. He takes his job very seriously but finds ways to not be cynical or toxic to the point where it defines his whole identity. I would say he is one of my biggest role models, and sort of a template for me of how to do this job. Now we are more colleagues than ever and better friends. I feel like I can set my own vision for the program and talk

to him about it in more of a negotiation. I have a lot more autonomy and confidence as a teacher, but know he is always there to support me. The defining characteristic of our journey has been the ability to find compromise and create a joint vision.

Similarly, Jamaal also works with his supervising teacher from student teaching, who is also the previously mentioned mentor from his high school years. He described the relationship and its influence:

He is the most influential person I have in my life when it comes to music, and our relationship really started to progress in the early semesters of my teaching career. I believe he is the best qualified person to give me feedback on my teaching because he has been the one to see my progress through the years.

From these reflections, it seems evident that the influence of college professors and later mentor–teacher relationships can play prominent roles in the occupational socialization of novice band music educators. Each participant was able to articulate their thoughts of specific and important individuals, and it was possible to view these relationships as part of their music teacher identity construction.

Summary

Analysis revealed the music teacher identity of the participants was formed through a variety of influences. Commentary from the participants outlined the sequential stages of this process from their early musical experiences during their childhoods and adolescence and through their initial encounters with playing an instrument in band class. Additionally, the participants detailed their experiences from high school and college, and they recalled meaningful influences of their past teachers and mentors. Finally, the participants shared their impressions of the impact of relationships with colleagues early on in their teaching careers.

Each of these stages is an important part of the occupational socialization process and the construction of each participant's music teacher identity.

Many aspects of the occupational socialization of the participants followed processes consistent with extant research. According to scholars, the music teacher identity of the participants likely originally flowed from the performer role (Haston & Russell, 2012; Isbell, 2008; Woodford, 2002). Young musicians are typically socialized as performers first, and the participants echoed this with their references to the influences of applied teachers. Additionally, the influence of teachers and leadership roles was apparent in their reflections.

Research Question 3: How do these teachers view and understand the role of conducting in their pedagogy?

The participants had limiting definitions or views of conducting and its use in their classroom. Each participant was asked to describe their views on conducting, to detail experiences they felt were preparatory to this understanding, and to discuss how they believed they used conducting in their daily lives as music educators. What follows is a detailed analysis of the participants' views on the intersectionality (or lack thereof) of music teacher identity and conductor identity.

Early Experiences With Conducting

The participants' initial experiences with conducting may provide clues to their current views on conducting as novice music teachers. In particular, Leah discussed her lack of experience prior to conducting class:

> Unlike many educators I've met, I wasn't a drum major in high school. When I came into college, I was pretty fresh other than just watching famous conductors at concerts and on YouTube™ videos. My preexposure to conducting was very minimal.

Jamaal discussed the first time he recognized conducting as an art form or something that could influence how musicians performed:

I think freshman year of high school was the first time I really saw someone conduct. It was during the second semester concert band when I saw my high school band director conduct for the first time. I thought, "Wow, this is not the baton hitting the stand like in middle school! You want me to look at this thing and identify the pulse? Okay, this is different." Once I figured out what he was like, I participated in All-County, All-District, and All-State events with other conductors doing different things with the same concepts. I realized I had to interpret all of those different things that all kind of meant the same thing but were slightly nuanced. That is when I realized how expressive conducting could be.

Like many in the field, Bryant's early conducting exposure centered around high school drum major involvement. His commentary discussed the impact of his experiences:

I guess the first thing would be as a high school drum major. So I was chosen as a senior and ended up going to a drum major camp that summer. So I got to study and be introduced to conducting by the staff at the camp. Other than this experience, my instrumental conducting class as a junior in college was the first time I picked up a baton in front of a concert band.

From the participant commentary it is clear each arrived to conducting class with slightly different perspectives and varied amounts of prior exposure to conducting. These variables resulted in an inconsistent knowledge base for the participants related to the art of conducting, its purpose, and its role in their lives as future teachers. When considering the narrative of the participants, it was clear that being or not being a drum major in high school or college was the

44

most visible experience the participants associated with conducting (at that time in their lives). Remember that conducting, for the purposes of the current study, was defined by the researcher as the physical manifestation of the conductor's specific expressive interpretation of a musical score via nonverbal dialogue with an ensemble. Future research in conductor identity could explore the way(s) in which drum major experience influences the identity of novice music educators.

Definitions of Conducting

The four participants also had varying definitions for what conducting actually meant to them. Leah saw conducting as more of an organizational tool for students:

> At the bare-bones of it, I think conducting is keeping time and making sure the ensemble is together. From there I think conducting and score studying means you are studying what that composer has put forth and trying to make their ideas come alive through conducting and through the performance. I think it is intertwined, conducting and performing. There has to be this symbiotic relationship. I have to be able to adapt to the students and them to me.

Jamaal saw conducting as a form of musical leadership where the conductor is leading the musicians towards new experiences:

> I think conducting is the nonverbal part of directing a group of musicians and like being a guide. Even at the high school and middle school level, you are guiding someone. You are guiding a group of musicians to a place they are unsure of as individuals. Conductors are the glue that meshes all of the different parts together in a way the students may not be able to identify themselves. So conducting is to be a navigator.

Kate saw conducting as a way of communicating with students nonverbally but drew a distinction between conducting and teaching:

> I think conducting is a visual explanation when words fail. Not that I think my visual cues are any better than my words. I would say conducting is when the band is performing and you are giving them hand gestures with it. I would not necessarily say I think there is a difference between conducting and teaching. Conducting is always teaching, but teaching is not always conducting.

Bryant's definition of conducting centered around communicating musical concepts other than tempo:

> I think to me the most basic part of conducting is conveying and leading in a sort of energetic essence. I think it is deeper than showing time. Showing time is obviously important, but I want to teach a roomful of students who can keep time on their own. Of course, I'm showing time so students can use me as a reference point, but I want to train them to have that sense on their own so that it is not strictly coming from me. Once you get past that, I feel like there is a relationship between energy in the body and the sound that we make. It is very nonverbal or deeper than words, but I feel like what I'm doing is showing the way that I want to express the music. I'm trying to paint a picture with my hands and body of what I want students to do with their sound so we can create something deeper.

> When asked to provide a definition of conducting, the participants did not offer a consistent definition. Using the definition of conducting as defined above, each identified a portion of what it meant to be a conductor, but alone they were individually operating via a limiting view. The participants, however, defined conducting more narrowly as an organizational

tool, used via nonverbal communication that led students towards advanced musical concepts. By viewing conducting in the more broadened terms outlined above (as individuals), the participants may have found more connection to their actions in the classroom and be more inclined to view the conductor role as part of their music teacher identity construction.

Use of Conducting in Participants' Classrooms

Beyond exploring the participants' notable experiences and personal definitions of conducting, each had varying understandings of its impact on their teaching and use in their classrooms. Data analysis of the participant commentary revealed several prominent ideas concerning this concept:

1. Conducting is a tool that can be used in the classroom.

2. Conducting is situational and changes for different ensembles.

3. Interpreting conducting is something students must be taught.

First, the participants agree that conducting can be used as a tool for teaching musicianship. During the focus group Jamaal specifically discussed this topic:

> I see conducting as a tool for teaching. As some kind of, maybe not a catalyst, but as a vessel through which we can help communicate something. I see conducting as something that every teacher should know how to do because it only adds to your teaching. The same way that you would learn how to use technology, you would learn how to conduct as a method of communicating knowledge or information that you would not be able to communicate during certain spaces, like during a performance.

Each of the participants had different ideas on the extent to which conducting was currently being used to teach musical concepts in their classroom. Bryant shared a great deal of information about how he used conducting in this way:

Even when kids are not playing, I try to show them with my hands and how I move my body the way they should play. If I'm talking about something like air or supporting a phrase, I use some sort of visual demonstration of the stability that I want with my hands, and I think that conveys a lot more information. I feel like we can convey more information in a more effective way and a more efficient way by showing instead of telling. Breathing is something that I have found is so much easier to show than describe. If I'm bringing somebody in, I try to breathe to show in my body how I want them to breathe before they create the phrase. I also think it is always easier to show the sort of articulation I want instead of talking about it. I also think that it is much easier and much more effective to show the weight with the hands.

Echoing and expanding on this idea, Jamaal spoke specifically about how he used conducting to teach musical concepts:

When I teach, my conducting is usually a reflection of what I'm asking them for at that time. My conducting is almost like an affirmation of the words that I'm saying when I'm teaching. The conducting just reinforces the words and helps the students recognize the translation of conducting. When I say, "I need you to play this shorter," and then they see a shift in the way that I conduct, they will start to notice that change in my conducting means that I want them to change their playing.

In contrast to Bryant and Jamaal, Kate and Leah expressed doubts concerning the extent to which they use their conducting. Related to her personal definition of conducting, Kate talked about how she did not see herself using conducting very much:

From where I understand it now, I don't think I use conducting a ton in the classroom. I have been trying to actively think about it more while I'm on the podium to see if there

are any demonstrations outside of when we are just playing through things, but that is not my main focus.

Additionally, Kate also differentiated her thoughts on conducting versus teaching:

I would say that I'm teaching between the reps and conducting through the repetitions. Unless it is a scenario with ritardando, rubato, accelerando, I don't think I teach students the flow of the piece through my conducting. I think the things I say between the repetitions is where the teaching happens. Obviously, we learn aurally, but I don't necessarily think that my conducting is what teaches the students.

Kate also discussed other tools she feels are used more prominently in her teaching instead of conducting. For instance, she discussed her use of singing and modeling in her classroom:

Conducting is not my go-to. I sing a ton on the podium because I'm a percussionist, so I can't pull a marimba out of my pocket to demonstrate. So I use my voice a ton. A lot of times I will sing and end a note and then do some sort of visual thing, but I would say the visual stuff is like 10% of the time.

Leah also seemed hesitant to say conducting played a large role in the actual teaching of musical concepts. She discussed how she used conducting, or simply being on the podium, as a tool for classroom management:

So I think a few different scenarios come to mind. I have definitely used conducting for a classroom management skill. If the room is not quite where it needs to be, I can jump on the podium, and they know that there are consequences. I think there is definitely a classroom management aspect of the conducting because, for whatever reason, if students weren't paying attention, if we needed a change of pace.

The idea that conducting can be used as a tool to teach musical concepts to students is not consistent for all four participants. It was difficult to determine if this concept was prevalent enough to allow the participants to see themselves as conductors or to view their music teacher identity through that lens.

Conducting Is Situational

An additional idea that emerged from the data was the participants' view that conducting is situational and changes for different ensembles. Several of the participants related this concept to the rehearsal process. For instance, Kate discussed this idea as part of a sequence in her teaching:

> When we are in the beginning stages of things, I don't find I do a lot of conducting. I would rather them just be comfortably looking at their music instead of looking at me because I'm not sure they are comfortable enough to pick their eyes up for that long. Eventually they are, and eventually we can do more. So, for that reason I don't do a lot of conducting at first.

Additionally, Bryant discussed a similar point of view:

> To me the lynchpin is in the specific student or the group I'm working with. It seems to me like there are definitely times where conducting means I need to help them find a beat somewhere. There are other times when the group gets to a place where we need to start talking about expression and phrasing. That is when I think my conducting is obviously a different type of tool. I try to not go to a place where I'm thinking more about my own personal art through conducting when really what the kids need is for me to help them develop other skills.

Leah related a similar sentiment but also connected the idea to how she initially expected to use conducting in her teaching:

> Depending on where in the process I'm teaching, it is sometimes showing simple beats and thinking, "Sit down, don't stand up, and don't break your instruments." Everything I thought was going to be super useful, perhaps advanced conducting techniques, I thought I would have a chance to use by now, at this point, I haven't.

Participants also seemed to believe conducting is dependent on the size of the ensemble or confined to upper-level ensembles, older students, and collegiate ensembles. Kate discussed the size of the ensemble and the impact it had on her perceptions of herself as a conductor.

> It definitely depends on the size of the ensemble. When you have a marching band in front of you of 150 people, it feels pretty great when you get them to do exactly what they are supposed to. But when I'm conducting a small percussion ensemble, while it feels good when they are really precise and I know I'm helping them get there, it is not as much of a rush.

The participants also discussed how conducting was better suited for older students and more advanced ensembles. Bryant also discussed how ensemble variables affected his views of conducting:

> It definitely does shift compared to who I'm talking to. I think that process just gets more refined as you go through and as the students get older. When I give them that gesture later on, they know what I'm looking for because they have a previous experience that provides the explanation.

Kate's perspectives on ensembles and experience levels expanded this viewpoint:

It depends on the ensemble you are with. You know? I think at a beginning fifth-grade

band concert, I would not need to show anything other than a very clear beat pattern. But,

when I conduct the ninth-grade band, I think I need to do more based on what the

students need. I think it is difficult to walk the path of exactly what each ensemble needs,

and I think some people tend to go overboard with it.

She went on to discuss her thoughts on conducting, its place in the classroom, and her

relationship with her students:

I teach the second band at the high school and have to reteach a lot of basics. We are not

necessarily playing a lot of pieces where intricate conducting is needed. I guess I would

say there is not necessarily that much of an opportunity for teaching through conducting.

I relate conducting to more higher-level things, and I don't feel I have the opportunity for

art in my conducting.

The participants also discussed how their conducting would change if they were teaching

different levels of students. Jamaal's perspective centered around the current ability of his

students and the concept that conducting was an elevated art form:

In a perfect world where the kids could see their music and know what is going on, I

would conduct to my heart's content. I also think in a perfect world, my program would

not be in tiers. The lowest-level students would be able to focus on their music and on

me, and on what I'm trying to say through my conducting. So, if I were teaching a bunch

of baby college kids, I would practice conducting more because I think I would need to! I

would do it far more often because I would see that as the way for me to speak. I would

probably take a chunk out of the day just to practice, and I would enjoy it more. I think

pedagogy is how well you can communicate information, and conducting is part of that

pedagogy. I already enjoy conducting, but I would enjoy learning more about it if I knew it had immediate effects on my ninth-grade band.

Leah discussed a very similar outlook but added thoughts about the level of music her students were currently able to perform and the limitations she felt in teaching that music:

I think if I were in a different role I would have to be much more refined in my conducting skills depending on the level of the literature. The literature that I'm working on with my students is that .5/1 grade level to make sure it is accessible for everyone, and to be honest, the type of music that I'm teaching right now does not require a high level of conducting, at least in my opinion. I think my conducting philosophy could change if I were working at a higher level because the demands would be higher.

Overall, from this commentary it was clear the participants viewed the role of the conductor as situational and something that changes depending on the ensembles they are teaching. The current ability of the students, the difficulty level of the music being taught, the size of the ensemble, and the place in the teaching sequence were all identified as factors contributing to the view of situational conducting.

Interpreting Conducting Must Be Taught

The examination of the participants' views on conducting and its uses in their teaching identified one further concept. The participants believed that their students must be taught to interpret conducting gestures. The participants discussed how conducting was something they believed students must be introduced to slowly and an understanding that must be nurtured over time. Bryant detailed his views by describing how he thinks students should be taught to interpret conducting as part of a continual process:

I think you have to teach the students what to look for in your conducting. I think we

need to teach them to watch conducting in a different way. Use your eyes and look, but

also in a deeper sense you have to be receptive to what I'm doing. I'm trying to show

students the way I want them to play or the way that I think we should interpret this. I

want them to be on the lookout for that, be tuned into what I'm showing, and to be aware

of that idea.

From this it seems Bryant connected his desire to teach through his conducting with his

responsibility to help students understand his gestures. Leah outlined a similar concept but

pointed out the difference between music classes and others in the typical school setting:

I see conducting as facilitating another activity in the classroom. Again, it is another

norm. It is a norm that they never learned when a teacher steps on this weird box thing

that means you go silent. And it is my job to teach them what these things mean, and of

course the first few months I'm like, "Well how do they not understand that?" and it is

because it is their first time learning that. So I don't know if you can take away the

teaching from conducting. I think in some sense you are either teaching them how to

conduct, or you are teaching them something through your conducting.

Jamaal shared similar thoughts:

The idea of, I would be on the podium, and I would be conducting and conducting, but I

would be so focused on myself that it took me a while to realize that the students weren't

focused on me because they did not know what a baton was. Our feeders are also quite

weak. So when they saw a baton it was usually just hitting a stand, or it was the day of

the concert and they weren't really looking up anyway. So a lot of it was teaching them

how to see a conductor and what exactly that is.

He later expanded his thoughts in a way that supported Bryant's and Leah's commentary:

Someone mentioned you have to teach students what conducting is, and I think my students are in a similar boat. I think I'm in a situation where students have a very underdeveloped relationship with conducting. It is almost like a language, when you are talking to a young child and you are trying to speak to them, you don't use academic language but instead you are talking to them at their level. I think when students don't have that relationship with conducting, you have to conduct at that level. As they grow you can start to expand on that language, and that is when the artistry comes in because they have an understanding of what you are saying and can take the gestures you show and translate them into words or ideas.

The idea of speaking in the current language of students was echoed by Kate. Her thoughts detailed a change in her thinking as her career progressed:

I made a mistake so many times early in my career. In my first year I would say, "Okay, this needs more phrasing," and they would probably be thinking, "Yeah, okay," and I would say a phrase like, "Yeah, okay, great, you get it, moving on." I didn't take the time to make sure they got it. Now, conducting aside, every concept I take the time to say, "Do we understand what I mean when I say key signature? Do we understand what the top number in a time signature means?" I want to make sure that every single student in the classroom understands it. I think this relates to conducting too. The first time I explain a concept I talk a lot with my hands. I don't realize how much I speak with my hands, but when I explain a concept like, "Okay, we are going to lift off of this note, I need space, I need daylight between these notes." I use the words and the visual at the same time.

Bryant also reflected on his use of conducting in the classroom as a less experienced teacher. Similar to Kate, he described the relationship through a sequence:

> It is cool to have beginners because we can go in and really slow down and really break down that whole process and build it from the beginning. I think I made a couple of mistakes my first couple of years of not doing that. I would be explaining stuff to students and have them play, and I would just start conducting. I think the students would kind of start to intuitively follow a little bit, but then I realized that nobody has ever explained to them what this means. Now I like to get more detailed about it to make sure they understand.

Leah offered further insight into how she differentiates her instruction for younger students:

> With the younger students I like to do the pretend to be a conductor with your pencil or your bow; it is a little unwieldy, so I have them pick up their pencil instead. I like to do those exercises with the young students because, again, they don't have a lot of experience with what conducting and ensemble work means from their previous schooling, so I have to teach them. And I think the best way for you to learn and experience those things is for you to get an understanding of what that means, so actually asking them to pick up the pencil and conduct.

Summary

By exploring these novice band music educators' early conducting experiences in relation to their personal definitions and thoughts about conducting and their current awareness of its use in their classrooms, a more complete understanding of the intersectionality of music teacher identity and conductor identity was demonstrated. From the data, it is clear that the participants have a limiting view of conducting and its uses and therefore experience difficulty including the

conductor role as part of their music teacher identity. There also appear to be some misconceptions or judgments by participants, which led to their current ideas that could be alleviated through professional development or additional study of conducting. By exploring their access to and views of these opportunities, a more complete understanding may be found.

The previous section discussed the various ways each participant defined, perceived, and used conducting in their classrooms. In the following discussion, an additional aspect of their experience will be examined—their fears and emotions associated with learning more about conducting.

Lack of Professional Development Opportunities or Mentors in the Field

The most prominent cue that the participants experienced fears connected to continued study of conducting was evident in their descriptions of the available professional development opportunities. Each participant was dissatisfied with the amount of music-specific professional development available to them via their schools or school districts and also discussed the lack of specific conducting feedback upon the completion of their conducting courses and music education degrees. For example, Bryant discussed the lack of opportunities to focus on his conducting:

> Since I have graduated college, I have received zero instruction on how to become a better conductor at all. It is just not something that I'm exposed to. Who is going to teach me how to conduct? Unless you are really ambitious about seeking it out, those opportunities don't just come to you. The technology stuff is available. Learning how to teach technique or fundamentals, those things come to you with experience. But, there haven't been a lot of pathways for me to learn how to be a better conductor since college.

Bryant also struggled to find the motivation to pursue help with his conducting based on the other responsibilities included in his teaching assignment:

> I'm the guy who conducts. There is nobody around for me to study because I'm the guy who does that here in this county. It is a bit more difficult to get to a place where you are able to study with other people. The resources are definitely there now in terms of YouTube™ and stuff like that but, that is something I haven't developed the motivation to do. I don't have that conducting mentorship or role model thing going, and it is kind of a black hole. Once you get into your gig there are so many more mundane challenges that have to be met every day that it is easy, at least for me, to let conducting go by the wayside to the point that you almost don't even think about it.

Jamaal also discussed a lack of mentor relationships and the negative effects he perceives in his teaching:

> Music is not like a math class. I can go over to the next math teacher and say, "How did you do this?" and they can say, "Oh I did it this way and learned it this way." In music, you go next door and you get the cafeteria. So you are sitting here on this island, and you can reach back and ask other people, but music is full of all these hyper-specific situations.

From these comments it is clear Bryant and Jamaal feel they are not only isolated in their roles as music educators without a mentor, but they also struggle to integrate these ideas for themselves in that void.

In addition to a perceived lack of mentor relationships, several participants discussed the role of professional development, or lack thereof, in relation to their growth as educators. Leah

spoke about the misappropriation of professional development hours in her school district and how little of the discussions included music-specific ideas, let alone conducting:

> So, the closest we have gotten to anything related to conducting would be in a small group but, the only thing I could point to about conducting may be when the band directors were talking about marching band and logistics. Specifically working on conducting? No, that unfortunately has not happened on those professional development days. Every time I have seen the teachers, they are either burnt out, need to vent, or need a score I have. So, those meetings really come to bare bones, what does everybody need in the moment.

Bryant also spoke of his frustrations concerning professional development, the lack of options, and his negative experiences. He discussed specifically concerning the desire for professional development that would be more helpful to him as an educator:

> If I'm going to have to invest these hours for recertification, I want to do something that actually helps. I know a lot of people don't look at it that way, and a lot of people want to find something easy they can play in the background while doing the dishes. I'm definitely looking for ways to improve my teaching in any way possible.

Kate also discussed the lack of professional development opportunities and her negative associations because of this missing role. She also suggested a possible solution to fix the issue:

> They always say that "Oh, during our 7 days of professional development we are going to have before school starts, one of those days will be dedicated to fine arts and you guys can really go through your curriculum together." It just becomes a giant pissing contest, to be honest with you. I think it would be really great if we could have someone come teach us as teachers for a day. We could have them come in and teach the beginning

59

classes, and we could pick things up from them. But, if someone could just come in and

talk to us, that would be great.

Leah added to this concept by discussing her feelings as a novice music educator and her fears

associated with being alone in the classroom upon graduation:

I think a lot of what was said about working with somebody in your school would have

been really helpful for me my first year. I don't know if this is possible in undergraduate

training or even possible in a teaching certification, just generally something that could

happen before we become full-fledged teachers alone in the classroom. But what was

really jarring for me was, you are working towards this goal in undergrad of becoming a

teacher. Learning these things and getting ready. My student teaching experience, again,

was almost like this coddled, perfect little bubble of what a really great program could be.

Then the training wheels were ripped off, I was thrown out the door, and now I'm here in

a totally new situation. I think what would have been awesome for me is if I walked into

a job that had a primary teacher, lead teacher in the room, and I could still be mentored. I

could be a co-teacher. I would be there but with an extra step of taking the training

wheels off. Especially when your degree program does not prepare you for a certain

school, you have no way to know where to even start.

Leah's views demonstrated how she felt abandoned in her early career, and while her comments

were not directly connected to conducting, they do speak to the amount of stress novice teachers

experience and the ways it can impact their teaching. Jamaal had similar feelings concerning the

missing curriculum from his undergraduate experience. In his commentary, he discussed an

integration of verbal and nonverbal teaching strategies and how he wished his degree program

would have included more specific instruction:

If we had a course that was dedicated to solving problems verbally and nonverbally, that would be the education class that I think everyone would hold on to. If I had a class specifically about being on the podium and being an educator, I think I would be so much more effective, so much more comfortable, I would see myself in a more positive light when I work with the kids because I know what I'm doing has been vetted, has been tested, has been approved, and is being pushed out to the masses that "Oh, these other veteran teachers do this thing too."

The lack of professional development options and mentors has left the participants without adequate resources to explore the emerging role of conductor included in their jobs as band music educators. Without the necessary access to professional development at the local level, educators may be limited to opportunities offered at the state and national level, which may not be as easily accessible for educators or especially applicable to their teaching situations. The inability to secure professional development specifically aimed at improving conducting skills has left the participants without an easily affordable, low-stress avenue to explore the use of conducting in their teaching. This may hinder their development as conductors, making it less likely for them to identify with the conductor as part of their music teacher identity. Considering the scarcity of local and specific professional development in the eyes of the participants, it may be helpful to explore their views of continued study specific to conducting.

Fears Associated With Continued Study of Conducting

In addition to a lack of professional development and mentor opportunities postgraduation, the participants also discussed their fears associated with continued conducting study. Either through a negative connection to improving their conducting skills based on previous experiences, or fears connected to avenues for continued study, the participants'

61

statements reflected their concerns with this aspect of their teaching. In particular, Kate discussed the negative connotations she has associated with conducting. Through multiple interviews, her commentary demonstrated her struggle with conducting and her past experiences with conductors:

> I feel like it is selfish, to be completely frank with you. I feel like if I do any curly-q, fancy stuff, not beat time for a second, it doesn't set the students up for success. My goal is to be as clear for them as possible and to not get in the way at all. I just don't think I have the opportunity to be a conductor, and maybe that is that I don't trust my kids. There is just so much that I'm still trying to fix, and I just want to be as helpful for them as possible. I feel like clarity in the arms is what they need.

Kate also spoke of how conducting may not be as important to teaching her students:

> Sometimes I try to get way too into it, which is kind of where I started at the beginning of my career, and I realized, these kids are not watching. They are still trying to figure out what this is, they don't know anything. So that is why I have pulled back a lot in the last couple of years. When we go through sightreading stuff, it is literally like, okay, here is time. I'm telling them exactly what is happening in the music, because clarity is what they need.

Jamaal echoed the idea that focusing on conducting could take away from student experiences:

> I saw myself so much as an educator first that conducting was something to help me look good after the education was done. So I don't think that I ever really saw it as a priority. I feel like teaching is so heavy and so impactful that if that's not my priority that I'm taking away from the students' education.

Leah's statements strengthen and support Jamaal's comment:

My conducting skills and thoughts about conducting have been put on the back burner just because there are so many bigger issues that I have had to deal with. Between managing the classroom, making sure students stay awake because some did not get sleep last night, as well as managing instruments, I just don't see my conducting as a prevalent part in my teaching right now. I see it more as a utilitarian tool that I have in my pocket.

The data suggests the participants are experiencing similar conflicts concerning conducting, what it means to be a conductor, and how to include it as part of their music teacher identity. Multiple participants referenced feeling as if focusing on their conducting would be selfish or could take away from what their students actually needed. Additionally, participants noted their wide-ranging responsibilities as educators required more focus and attention than their conducting skill. In the section that follows, these factors were connected to their personal definitions of conducting and their perceptions of its usefulness in their teaching.

Negative Conducting Experiences and Perceptions of Conducting Symposia

Each of the four participants had specific reflections about negative conducting experiences and/or their negative perceptions of conducting symposia. Based on a comment from Jamaal, this could be the result of the way in which conducting was taught to each participant.

I think we are taught conducting with the end goal of conducting a group that already understands exactly what is written on the paper. That is to say, some higher-level high school or collegiate group. I feel like the conducting classes that I took would serve me better in those places than they would in high school or middle school. I know the ninth graders we have don't even know how to read my conducting, and they don't know how to watch. How can I do anything fancy like melding a beat when these students can't count? We are still trying to get them to get dotted quarter notes together, so I can't meld

63

beats. We have to show them explicitly. I think that is really where the big disconnect is.

I think if conducting was taught as an extension of pedagogy, then college students would

feel more comfortable going out and teaching in schools.

The idea that conducting courses were disconnected from real-world applications was not completely consistent across all four participants, but Kate seemed to agree with Jamaal's point, at least in part. It seems possible her fears associated with continued conducting study were less to do with conducting courses and more to do with negative models encountered during her undergraduate degree:

My conducting class was very functional: this is how you conduct in a way that makes

sense, is productive, and is useful for the people that you are conducting. Then at the

same time, I had people who I was in classes with or graduate student conductors who

would come in and teach chamber ensembles, and it was a whole other thing: "What are

you doing with your arms? What is beat one? Are you an acrobat? What is happening?"

Those people sort of had this air about them that was very, "Well, I'm a conductor so I'm

mightier than thou." I definitely had a contrast in the different types of conducting

exposure.

The fears and negative connotations associated in continued study in conducting

extended to the participants' thoughts and feelings concerning conducting symposia. Bryant

shared the following:

I think there is an idea that if people sign up for a conducting symposium, somebody is

going to throw them on a podium, have them conduct something, and then tear them

apart in front of a live audience when it clearly does not go as well as it could. I think that

a lot of people are averse to being that vulnerable. I feel I'm vulnerable enough where I

64

would be willing to go, but I'm not sure that that is where I would learn the best. You know? I definitely think that some people are not ready to take the plunge. It is hard to think, "Yeah, throw me up in front of your university wind ensemble and then tell me how terrible I'm when I don't, without giving me any prerequisite knowledge about what exactly you want me to do, get it right."

Aside from the vulnerability required at conducting symposia, Leah shared her concerns about additional factors prohibiting her from participating in such events such as time of year, cost, and expectations:

If it is right before or after concert season, I'm either too stressed out or too burnt out and need a break. I think it has to be at a specific time in the year. I also think if my school paid for it, that would be great. Though if I were really interested in a workshop, I would pay for it myself, and I would prioritize that experience. When I have looked into conducting workshops, some have had a slew of requirements. I think maybe some flexibility in the rules or expectations of the workshop would help because you never know what is going on in everyone's lives. If I could give it my all to one piece, that is what I would want to do. I don't want to do the others just waving my arms because I can. I really want to do the score study, put in the work, and I don't want to waste anyone's time. I think being able to attend those different workshops with peers, with fellow colleagues, is always helpful.

Summary

From the data collected, it is possible to say the participants have negative views of the professional development opportunities available to them and negative connotations of continued study in conducting. These views created a hesitation to include the conductor role as part of

their music teacher identity construction. According to the participants, conductors were often less concerned with student outcomes and tended to focus more on their own musical expression. To combat these views participants may need additional time in the field to develop a more complete understanding of the musical needs of their students and their availability to meet those needs through a variety of means that includes conducting.

It is evident the participants were experiencing difficulty navigating these aspects of their teaching due to the great deal of conflicting responsibilities they felt. It was also clear that some of the participants may have encountered negative conducting role models over the course of their education and early career that have negatively impacted their occupational socialization in regards to conducting. It may be possible to resolve these concepts through a different approach to professional development, additional opportunities to explore conducting and its uses in the classroom, and adjustments to the way continued study in conducting is presented to novice band music educators.

CHAPTER V: CONCLUSIONS

This multiple case study explored music teacher identity construction and the possible formation of a conductor–educator role merger in novice band music educators. The three specific research questions were:

1. How do novice band music educators describe their teacher identity?

2. What factors influence the formation of this identity?

3. How do these teachers view and understand the role of conducting in their pedagogy?

Based on data analysis, four themes emerged that offer a more specific view of music teaching from the perspective of the participants:

1. The music teacher identity of the participants was formed through a variety of influences.

2. The participants experienced role stress as part of the occupation socialization process of novice band music educators.

3. The participants had limiting definitions or views of conducting and its use in their classroom.

4. The participants had fears associated with pursuing continued study in conducting due to the lack of professional development opportunities postgraduation and negative connotations with the available options.

What follows is a discussion of the main conclusions drawn from the study.

Key Findings

Difficulty Describing Music Teacher Identity

The formation of the participants' music teacher identity was influenced by a variety of factors including their previous experiences as well as their understanding of and reflection on these experiences. The participants described their identities by communicating their various

experiences, discussing their views of model teachers, and discussing the roles they occupied in their professional lives. In their descriptions it became clear they struggled with the hierarchy of their various roles (pseudoparent, advocate, business manager, life coach, and counselor) and seemed to have difficulties identifying a primary role. When the roles were more clearly defined by the researcher, the participants identified responsibilities that were extramusical as their primary responsibilities, making it less likely to fully see themselves as operating in roles specifically devoted to music making such as conducting.

These findings align with extant research concerning the identity formation of music teachers and role stress, as the concept of teachers struggling between aspects of multiple roles was outlined by previous researchers (Haston & Russell, 2012; Johnson, 2014; Natale-Abramo, 2015). This research also supports Scheib's (2003) description of role stress and the earlier claims that the socialization process contributed to this confusion (Haston & Russell, 2012; Johnson, 2014; Pellegrino, 2009; Woodford, 2002). Finally, these findings correlate with Isbell's (2014) suggestion that role stress for educators may be due to the amount of time available to develop educator roles in degree programs. Taken together, additional research may offer new insight into the socialization of music educators in relation to conducting.

The Role of Conducting

From the data, it was difficult to ascertain if the participants saw their music teacher identities as a merger (i.e., joining together) of educator and conductor, as they did not view themselves as conductors. In this case it may be best to view music teaching and conducting as separate entities, representing more of an intersection, rather than a merger, for novice music educators.

As novice music educators deal with many responsibilities, roles, and obstacles, the various aspects of their identities may first present as separate entities. As the socialization process continues and the various aspects of music teacher identity are more clearly understood by educators, greater awareness could lead to role mergers or changes in the music teacher identities of educators. The lived experiences of each participant outlined the progression of music teacher identity as novice teachers early in their careers. Over time, it is possible that the conductor role could emerge as part of their later identity construction.

These findings align with Pellegrino (2009), who suggested preservice and inservice music educators first view themselves as performers and then later, as educators. The conductor role could emerge in a tertiary way, either from the performer or educator roles previously adopted, depending on the socialization process of the individual educators as they enter midcareer status (i.e., leave novice status). If music schools find opportunities to lessen the confusion between the performer and educator roles as suggested by Pellegrino (2009) and Natale-Abramo (2015), perhaps additional role mergers could materialize in later stages of the educator's careers as suggested in the work of previous researchers (Forrester, 2017; Johnson, 2014; Natale-Abramo, 2015).

The Influence of University Faculty

Three of the four participants in the current study identified studio faculty as influential to their decisions to pursue music and music education in college. Further, two of the participants specifically mentioned music education faculty members as important to their development as music teachers. None of the participants, however, indicated that the conducting teacher had any influence on their music teacher identity construction. In fact, when discussing collegiate

experiences that specifically helped shape the participants' music teacher role identities, the conducting teachers were never mentioned at all.

These findings align with Isbell's (2008) suggestion that secondary socialization plays a large role in the process through which teachers understand their music teacher identity. The strength of the relationship noted between the participants and their applied faculty, as well as the influence of the performance culture, is also consistent with the extant research (Austin, Isbell, & Russell, 2010). In addition to this, the experiences outlined by the participants align with conductors and authors who have stated there is little time allocated to conducting in music education degree programs (Harris, 2001; Hunsberger, 1992). The participants' commentary (in the current study) about the nature of their conducting courses and their relationship to their course instructors may offer additional avenues for discussion and reflection. The experiences of the participants identify some possible areas of interest for conducting professionals, as well as future opportunities for research. What follows is a discussion of those opportunities.

Future Research

Many questions for further investigation related to discovering the circumstances under which the conductor role emerges in a music educator's identity construction remain. Those questions include, but are not limited to the following:

1. Do midcareer and veteran music teachers view themselves as conductors? If so, how do midcareer and veteran music teachers view conducting differently from novice teachers?

2. What do collegiate conductors view as the pivotal moment that allowed conducting identity to emerge in their lives?

3. How did professional conductors (e.g., symphony orchestras, operas, etc.) begin to identify themselves as conductors?

70

4. Is the view that focusing on conducting is selfish widespread among novice teachers?

5. What types of collegiate experiences would help to connect novice teachers more to the benefits of accurate conducting in school classrooms?

6. What types of professional development opportunities would be useful for novice teachers who are still developing their conducting skills?

The current research study could serve as a model to be replicated with a variety of professional conductors, university conducting and ensembles faculty, midcareer teachers, veteran teachers, and graduate students pursuing conducting degrees. Do the aforementioned professionals identify the conductor–educator roles as merging or intersecting? If so, under what circumstances? The findings of such studies could be useful in order to engineer strategies applicable to university conducting coursework, music education degree programs, and professional development opportunities for music educators in the field.

The role of conductor identity or conductor–educator role merger could also be studied with graduate conducting students to specifically examine the experiences that led them to pursue advanced degrees in conducting. Finally, the original participants from the study could be revisited later in their careers to determine how their perceptions and identities have been informed by additional time and experiences and to explore the possibility of conductor identity and/or role mergers as a byproduct of continued teaching.

Collaboration With Other Stakeholders

Further work in this area could take the form of collaboration between various stakeholders through conversations, curricular revision, podcasts, conference presentations, professional development opportunities, and outreach efforts. For example, most universities require one to three credits of conducting to complete a degree in music education. In contrast,

71

university students take many more credits of applied instrument study, ensemble participation, music history, and music theory coursework. Should conducting be more of a focus for students pursuing degrees in music education? Is there a further opportunity to include conducting practice and pedagogy in music education coursework, even though the courses may not be labeled as "conducting" courses? Perhaps a thorough examination of how conducting is included in baccalaureate degree programs, both formally and informally, is in order. This would expand the knowledge related to how conducting is included in music education degrees across the nation.

Further, the participants' experiences while pursuing bachelor's degrees were influential, and yet they still struggled to codify aspects of what they learned and apply it to their everyday teaching. Further exploration of teacher skill acquisition and mastery may help music teacher educators resolve the conflicts of learning new concepts versus applying those concepts in context for preservice and novice teachers.

Conductors and music teacher educators could also continue to collaborate with preservice and inservice music educators in search of yearly professional development opportunities that are applicable to their careers and also less stressful than the vulnerability required for conducting symposia. Identifying strategies to counter the idea that focusing on conducting is self-focused (closed and about the conductor), rather than other-focused (open and about the students), will be crucial to the success of any initiatives involving conducting. These opportunities could take the form of mentor programs, workshops for conferences, professional development for school districts, a YouTube™ series of short videos of conducting basics, and the development of a cache of video recordings of experts conducting popular repertoire. Opportunities like those listed above would enable researchers, conductors, and music teacher

educators to dismantle any misconceptions and negative connotations surrounding continuing to study conducting.

Final Summary

The findings of the study demonstrate the emerging role identities of novice music teachers and the role stress they encounter as teachers in the first 5 years of experience. In addition, participants spoke of the skills they obtained from the conducting courses they took but did not connect what they learned explicitly to their music teacher identity. Therefore, the process through which music educators begin to include the conductor role as part of their music teacher identity remains in question. Perhaps discovering the point where the performance socialization that music teachers receive prior to the start of their teaching careers is related to the art of conducting (in addition to performing on an instrument) is worthy of further research. Finally. the conductor role may develop over a longer period of time, possibly extending beyond the novice teaching years as outlined in this research. If so, discovering the means through which this occurs could offer a more complete view of music teacher identity construction and lead to further understanding of when teachers begin to take on the role of conductor.

REFERENCES

Austin, J. R., Isbell, D. S., & Russell, J. A. (2012). A multi-institution exploration of secondary

socialization and occupational identity among undergraduate music majors. *Psychology*

of Music, *40*(1), 66–83. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0022429412445208

Ballantyne, J., & Packer, J. (2004). Effectiveness of preservice music teacher education

programs: Perceptions of early-career music teachers. *Music Education Research*, *6*(3),

299–312.

Battisti, F. (2007). *On becoming a conductor*. Meredith Music.

Beijaard, D. Verloop, N., & Vermunt, J. (2000). Teachers' perceptions of professional identity:

An exploratory study from a personal knowledge perspective. *Teaching and Teacher*

Education. *16*(7), 749–764.

Berg, M. (2014). Preservice music teacher preparation for the conductor-educator role. In J. R.

Barrett & P. R. Webster (Eds.), *The Musical experience: Rethinking music teaching and*

learning. Oxford University Press.

https://www.oxfordscholarship.com/view/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199363032.001.0001/

acprof-9780199363032

Bernard, R. (2005). Making music, making selves: A case for reframing music teacher education.

Action, Criticism and Theory for Music Education, *4*(2).

Bouij, C. (1998). Swedish music teachers in training and professional life. *International Journal*

of Music Education, *os-32*(1), 24–32. https://doi.org/10.1177/025576149803200103

Brand, M. (1983). Stages of a teacher's career. *Music Educators Journal*, *69*(7), 49–51.

https://doi.org/10.2307/3396304

Christensen J., Burke, P., Fessler, R., & Hagstrom, D. (1983). *Stages of teachers' careers: Implications for professional development*. ERIC Clearinghouse on Teacher Education.

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Sage Publications.

DeLorenzo, L. (1992). The perceived problems of beginning music teachers. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 113*, 9–25.

Demaree, R., & Moses, D. (1994). *The complete conductor: A comprehensive resource for the professional conductor of the twenty-first century*. Prentice-Hall.

Doloff, L. (2007). "All the things we are": Balancing our multiple identities in music teaching. *Action, Criticism and Theory for Music Education, 6*(2). http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Dolloff6_2.pdf

Draves, T. (2012). Second-stage music teachers' professional identities. *Contributions to Music Education*, *39*, 31–51.

Forrester, S. H. (2017). Music teacher knowledge: An examination of the intersections between instrumental music teaching and conducting. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *65*(4), 461–482. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0022429417742124

Fuller, F. & Brown, O. (1975). Becoming a teacher. In K. Ryan (Ed.), *Teacher Education: The seventy-fourth yearbook of the national society for the study of education, Part II* (pp. 25-52). University of Chicago Press.

Fuller, F. (1969). Concerns of teachers: A developmental conceptualization. *American Educational Research Journal*, *6*(2), 207–226. https://doi.org/10.3102/00028312006002207

Green, E., & Malko, N. (1997). *The modern conductor* (6th ed.). Prentice Hall.

Haithcock, M. L., Geraldi, K. M., & Doyle, B. K. (2020). *The elements of expressive conducting*. Conway Publications.

Harris, F. (2001). *Conducting with feeling* (1st ed.). Meredith Music Publications.

Haston, W., & Russell, J. A. (2012). Turning into teachers: Influences of authentic context learning experiences on occupational identity development of preservice music teachers. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *59*(4), 369–392. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0022429411414716

Hunsberger, D., Ernst, R., Schindler, A.,1992). *The art of conducting* (2nd ed.). McGraw-Hill.

Isbell, D. S. (2008). Musicians and teachers: The socialization and occupational identity of preservice music teachers. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *56*(2), 162–178. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F8755123314547912

Isbell, D. S. (2014). The socialization of music teachers: A review of the literature. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, *34*(1), 5–12.

Johnson, E. (2014). "Conducting is everywhere!" A case study of the development of preservice music teacher occupational identity in a beginning conducting course. *Journal of Education and Training Studies, 2*(3). https://doi.org/10.11114/jets.v2i3.422

Marshall, G. (Ed.) (1994) *The concise Oxford dictionary of sociology*. Oxford University Press.

Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative design: A guide to design and implementation* (4th ed.). Jossey-Bass.

Natale-Abramo, M. (2015). The construction of instrumental music teacher identity. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 202*, 51–69. https://doi.org/10.5406/bulcouresmusedu.202.0051

Pellegrino, K. (2009). Connections between performer and teacher identities in music teachers:

    Setting an agenda for research. *Journal of Music Teacher Education, 19*(1), 39–55.

    https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1057083709343908

Saldaña, J. (2016). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (3rd ed). Sage.

Seidman, I. (2019). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education*

    and the social sciences (5th ed.). Teachers College Press.

Scheib, J. W. (2003). Role stress in the professional life of the school music teacher: A collective

    case study. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 51*(2), 124–136.

Stake, R. E. (2006). *Multiple case study analysis*. Guilford Press.

Waybright, D. A. (2006). *Basic conducting: An integrated approach of building conducting*

    technique and enhancing musicianship for beginning choral and instrumental conducting

    students. Turtle Press.

Woodford, P.G. (2002). The social construction of music teacher identity in undergraduate music

    education majors. In R. Colwell (Ed.), *Handbook of research on music teaching and*

    learning (pp. 675–694). Schirmer Books.

APPENDIX A: CONSENT TO ACT AS A HUMAN PARTICIPANT

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA AT GREENSBORO

CONSENT TO ACT AS A HUMAN PARTICIPANT

Project Title: Understanding Conductor–educator Identity Formation In Novice Band Music
Educators: A Case Study

Principal Investigator: J. Ben Jones and Faculty Advisor: Dr. Tami Draves

Participant's Name: _____

What are some general things you should know about research studies?

You are being asked to take part in a research study. Your participation in the study is voluntary.
You may choose not to join, or you may withdraw your consent to be in the study, for any
reason, without penalty.

Research studies are designed to obtain new knowledge. This new information may help people
in the future. There may not be any direct benefit to you for being in the research study. There
also may be risks to being in research studies. If you choose not to be in the study or leave the
study before it is done, it will not affect your relationship with the researcher or the University of
North Carolina at Greensboro. Details about this study are discussed in this consent form. It is
important that you understand this information so that you can make an informed choice about
being in this research study.

You will be given a copy of this consent form. If you have any questions about this study at any
time, you should ask the researchers named in this consent form. Their contact information is
below.

What is the study about?

This is a research project. Your participation is voluntary. the purpose of this study is to explore the possible development of conductor-educator identity in novice teachers and, in doing so, examine the current approach of conducting curricula's ability to prepare novice teachers.

Why are you asking me?

You are being asked because you are a band music educator in your first five years of your teaching career.

What will you ask me to do if I agree to be in the study?

You will participate in three interviews that will last approximately 60 minutes each. In the interviews you will be asked about your experiences, aimed at better understanding how you view yourself as a musician, teacher, and conductor. Topics of discussion will include your musical background, and your experiences with school music programs as a child, undergraduate teacher training course work, and conductor training course work.

The researcher will make an audio and video recording via Zoom during the study to ensure accurate transcription of interviews. If you do not give permission for the audio or video recording to be obtained, you cannot participate in this study. The study will also include a one focus group discussion of approximately 60 mins. This discussion group will include all participants of the study. You will be in the study for approximately 8 months. You can expect to spend a total of 6-8 hours in this study by completing interviews, participating in the focus group, and reviewing initial analysis of your data to ensure its accuracy.

Is there any audio/video recording?

Audio and video recording will be taken during the interviews and the focus group discussion via Zoom. If you do not give permission for the audio recording to be obtained, you cannot participate in this study. Because your image and voice will be potentially identifiable by anyone who hears the recording, your confidentiality for things you say on the recording cannot be guaranteed although the researcher will try to limit access to the recording as described below.

Audio recordings may be used for presentation of the research at a research conference or in front of other researchers if you grant permission. To protect your privacy, your name will not be used in the presentation though a voice cannot be fully de-identified.

What are the risks to me?

The Institutional Review Board at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro has determined that participation in this study poses minimal risk to participants.

If you have questions, want more information or have suggestions, please contact Ben Jones who may be reached at (704) 718-2062 or jbjones7@uncg.edu or Dr. Tami Draves who may be reached at (336) 298-2098 or at tjdraves@uncg.edu.

If you have any concerns about your rights, how you are being treated, concerns or complaints about this project or benefits or risks associated with being in this study please contact the Office of Research Integrity at UNCG toll-free at (855)-251-2351.

Are there any benefits to society as a result of me taking part in this research?

These results may be transferable to others who are interested in developing a more effective music education and conducting class curricula.

Are there any benefits to *me* for taking part in this research study?

There are no direct benefits to you. However, you may benefit from sharing and reflecting on your experience.

Will I get paid for being in the study? Will it cost me anything?

There are no costs to you or payments made for participating in this study.

How will you keep my information confidential?

Efforts will be made to keep your study-related information confidential. You will be identified by a self-chosen pseudonym in the study. Identifying information will not be stored with the data. Data will be stored in a secure Box account. Audio and video recordings of all interviews will be stored on a in a secure box account. All information obtained in this study is strictly confidential unless disclosure is required by law.

Will my de-identified data be used in future studies?

Your de-identified data will be kept indefinitely and may be used for future research without your additional consent.

What if I want to leave the study?

You have the right to refuse to participate or to withdraw at any time, without penalty. If you do withdraw, it will not affect you in any way. If you choose to withdraw, you may request that any of your data which has been collected be destroyed unless it is in a de-identifiable state. The investigators also have the right to stop your participation at any time. This could be because you have had an unexpected reaction, or have failed to follow instructions, or because the entire study has been stopped.

What about new information/changes in the study?

If significant new information relating to the study becomes available which may relate to your willingness to continue to participate, this information will be provided to you.

Voluntary Consent by Participant:

By participating in the study-related activities, you are agreeing you read this document, or it has been read to you, you fully understand its contents and you openly and willingly consent to take part in this study. By participating in the study-related activities, you are also agreeing all of your questions concerning this study have been answered, you are 18 years of age or older, and that you are agreeing to participate in this study as described to you by J. Ben Jones.

APPENDIX B: EMAIL RECRUITMENT SCRIPTS

<u>Email Script for Recommenders</u>

Hello_____,

My name is Ben Jones and I am a third-year doctoral student in instrumental conducting at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro. In my research, I am interested in better understanding how novice band music educators view their music teacher identity and what experiences have shaped the use and understanding of conducting as part of their identity structure.

I am writing to ask you to recommend band music educators in their first five years of teaching who may be interested in being part of this research for my dissertation document. Participation would include completing a brief demographics questionnaire, being interviewed regarding their experiences becoming a conductor-educator, participating in a focus group discussion with other participants, reviewing their interview transcripts, and offering their feedback throughout the process.

If you know any recent students who you feel would be interested in participating in this study, please reach out to them and ask for their permission to share contact information with me. Once permission is given, I will reach out to them with more information concerning the study.

If you have any questions about the research, or the procedures I will follow in the study, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Thank you so much for your consideration! I appreciate your time, and look forward to hearing from you soon.

J. Ben Jones, BME, MM

DMA Student, Instrumental Conducting

UNC Greensboro School of Music

Greensboro, North Carolina

Hello_____,

My name is Ben Jones and I am a third-year doctoral student in instrumental conducting at the

University of North Carolina at Greensboro. In my research, I am interested in better

understanding how novice band music educators view their music teacher identity and what

experiences have shaped the use and understanding of conducting as part of their identity

structure. I received your contact information from _____ and I am writing to see if you

would be interested and willing to be part of the research for my dissertation document.

Participation would include completing a brief demographics questionnaire, being interviewed

regarding your experiences becoming a conductor-educator, participating in a focus group

discussion with other participants, reviewing your interview transcripts, and offering your

feedback throughout the process.

While no study can guarantee complete anonymity, all of the data collected during the study

would be kept confidential and your identity would be obscured through the use of a self-chosen

pseudonym. In addition, neither your school nor the location would be disclosed. Finally, this

research will be cleared through the UNCG IRB process before we talk, and I am fully certified

through CITI training to conduct ethical research with human participants.

We can work together to find interview times that are convenient for you. We would need to

meet four times to talk: three times for your participant interviews, and once for the focus group

discussion with all participants.. Each meeting would last between 60-90 minutes. All of our

meetings would be conducted via Zoom.

I hope that you are interested! If you are, please respond with the best method for contacting you.

If you are not, you are welcome to respond and say so.

Thank you so much for your consideration! I appreciate your time, and look forward to hearing

from you soon.

J. Ben Jones, BME, MM

DMA Student, Instrumental Conducting

UNC Greensboro School of Music

Greensboro, North Carolina

Follow-Up Email Script for Participants

Hello _____,

Thank you so much for being willing to participate in this study. Over the next few days I will share several documents with you. I will email you the *Consent To Act As A Human Participant* form which you will need to sign and return to me electronically. I will also share with you, via a secure Box account, a link to the *Initial Demographic Questionnaire* as well as a copy of the questions to be used during the first interview.

Please look over these documents, and reach out to me if you have any questions.

Thank you for the opportunity to tell your story in this study. I am looking forward to working with you over the course of the coming months!

J. Ben Jones, BME, MM

DMA Student, Instrumental Conducting

UNC Greensboro School of Music

Greensboro, North Carolina

APPENDIX C: INTERVIEW AND FOCUS GROUP QUESTIONS

Preliminary Demographic Questionnaire

Sample Questions:

- Please tell me your age, how many years you have been teaching, and your job history.

    - Also, tell me where you grew up, what instrument you play, and where you attended college.

- Please describe your current teaching situation including a description of the city, the size of the school, and a description of the student population.

    - Additionally, describe the music program at the school in general terms and describe the ensembles you teach.

First Interview

Sample Questions:

- Please tell me a little about your early music exposure.

    - For instance, describe your middle school and high school music experience as well as your decision to major in music.

- Please describe the reasons you decided to attend the college or university you picked, the environment of the school, and, specifically, the music department.

- What do you remember about your decision to become a music teacher?

    - What qualities or personality traits do you believe are important to have as a teacher?

    - Who do you look up to as a mentor teacher or model, and why?

- ○ What experiences do you feel contributed to your desire to become a teacher?

- ○ Tell me about a time when you really felt like a teacher.

- What qualities or personality traits do you believe are important to have as a conductor?

  - ○ Please describe how you were first introduced to conducting.

  - ○ Who do you look up to as a mentor conductor / role model, and why?

  - ○ What experiences have been most impactful in your conducting?

  - ○ Tell me about a time when you really felt like a conductor.

Second Interview

Sample Questions:

- Please describe the experiences from your music education courses you feel best prepared you for your career.

  - ○ Looking back, what classes were most impactful?

  - ○ What, if anything, do you wish you would have been able to focus on more?

- Describe your undergraduate conducting class experience.

  - ○ For example, how many conducting classes did you take? Who taught the class(es)? How many students were in the class(es)? How many times did the class(es) meet per week?

  - ○ What do you remember from your conducting classes?

  - ○ What do you think were some of the most important things you learned from your conducting classes?

  - ○ Describe the interplay between the conducting classes and MUED coursework.

    - ■ Any feedback back from conducting after you left those courses?

- What types of professional development have you sought out in terms of teaching and/or conducting? (ie. workshops, clinics, lessons)
  - ANything from the local level?
    - Anything conducting specific?
  - What opportunities do you know about / are you aware of for improving your skills?
  - If you seek additional professional development, what would you choose to do? What kind of format would you find most helpful for exploring your role as conductor–educator?
  - What do you wish was available to you?
- If you were asked to describe your music teacher identity, "who are you?" what would you say?
  - What, if any, experiences have caused you to see yourself in this way

Third Interview

Sample Questions:
- Describe your philosophy of music education. How do conducting and large ensembles fit within your vision? How four you fit in this Phil?
  - What is conducting?
  - How, if at all, do you practice your conducting?
  - How do you use conducting in your teaching?
  - What motivates you to incorporate conducting practice into your routine and focus on conducting in your classroom?

- ○ Think back to your first year of teaching: what were you thinking about on the podium? How have things changed now? What were you thinking about as a teacher?
- How has your view of yourself as a music teacher and conductor changed since your time in college?
  - ○ Student teaching?
  - ○ How has your understanding of conducting and teaching changed since you began teaching? Why?
- Teachers occupy many roles during their daily work in the profession. What kinds of roles do you feel you live and work in the most?
  - ○ Tell me about a time when you felt conflicted between the various roles you have to occupy as a teacher?
  - ○ Do you see mergers

Focus Group Discussion

Sample Questions:
- Describe some of the typical daily routines you have in your classroom as a teacher and conductor on and off the podium.
- What experiences have been the most helpful, influential, or important for you in your journey of becoming a teacher and conductor? What about the least helpful, influential, or important?

  How would you describe the connection of teaching and conducting for you?

APPENDIX D: NOTICE OF EXEMPTION

To: Joseph Jones
School of Music
School of Music, 220 Music Building, Campus, Greensboro, NC 27402-6170

From: UNCG IRB

Date: 9/04/2020

RE: Notice of IRB Exemption
Exemption Category: 2.Survey, interview, public observation
Study #: 21-0018
Study Title: Understanding Conductor-Educator Identity Formation in Novice Band Music Educators: A Case Study

This submission has been reviewed by the IRB and was determined to be exempt from further review according to the regulatory category cited above under 45 CFR 46.101(b).

Study Description:

Using the lenses of identity construction and socialization, this study will explore the formation of a conductor-educator role identity in novice band music educators. Specific research questions will include (a) How do novice band music educators describe their teacher identity? (b) What factors influence the formation of this identity? and (c) How do these teachers view and understand the role of conducting in their pedagogy ?

This original qualitative study will present the experiences of novice band music educators in relation to their music teacher identity and use of conducting. This study will serve the profession by offering insight into how conducting pedagogy impacts novice teachers and could inform conducting teaching based on the experiences of the participants. From the study, it may also be possible to suggest approaches for improving conducting courses; develop strategies aimed towards helping music education students and novice music educators better understand their music teacher identity in relation to their conducting; and find new ways for music faculties to further support these educators.

Investigator's Responsibilities

Please be aware that any changes to your protocol must be reviewed by the IRB prior to being implemented. **Please utilize the the consent form/information sheet with the most recent version date when enrolling participants**. The IRB will maintain records for this study for three years from the date of the original determination of exempt status.

Please be aware that valid human subjects training and signed statements of confidentiality for all members of research team need to be kept on file with the lead investigator. Please note that you will also need to remain in compliance with the university "Access To and Retention of Research Data" Policy which can be found at http://policy.uncg.edu/university-policies/research_data/.